

eISSN 2413-9009



TRAEKTORIÂ NAUKI

International Electronic Scientific Journal

Vol. 5, No 11, 2019

AGRIS
CAB Abstract
CEEOL
CEJSH
Dialnet
DOAJ
East View's Universal Database
EBSCO
FSTA®
Index Copernicus
RePEc
CNKI Scholar
Ulrich's Periodical Directory

pathofscience.org

TRAEKTORIÂ NAUKI = PATH OF SCIENCE**Vol. 5****No 11****2019**

Founded in August 2015. Publishing monthly.

Publisher

Altezero, s.r.o. & Dialog
 4B, Južná trieda, Košice mestská časť Juh, 04001, Slovak Republic
 Ph.: (421) 905-38-36-97.

Founders:

Altezero, s.r.o., 4B, Južná trieda, Košice mestská časť Juh, 04001, Slovak Republic
 Publishing Center "Dialog", 2 Club Street, Solonitsevka, 62370, Ukraine

The journal is abstracted in the following international databases: AGORA, AGRIS, AiritiLibrary, Baidu Scholar, Bielefeld Academic Search Engine (BASE), CAB Abstract, Central and Eastern European Online Library (CEEOL), Food Science and Technology Abstracts, Index Copernicus (ICV 2018 = 100,0), Google Scholar, J-Gate, OpenAIRE, Polska Bibliografia Naukowa, ResearchBib, ScienceOpen, The Central European Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities (CEJSH), Türk Eğitim İndeksi, Ulrichsweb Global Serials Directory, WorldCat.

Editor in Chief:

Kataev A., PhD (Economics), Ass. Prof.

Editorial Board:

Aksenova E., PhD (Techniques), Ass. Prof.
 Ananchenko K., PhD (Physical Education and Sport), Ass. Prof.
 Bobro N., PhD (Sociology), Ass. Prof.
 Bolotnaya O., PhD (Economics), Ass. Prof.
 Holoborodko K., Doctor of Science (Language), Prof.
 Golubov A., PhD (Law), Ass. Prof.
 Zaytseva M., Doctor of Science (Arts), Prof.
 Zelenskaya L., Doctor of Science (Education), Prof.
 Kolos N., Doctor of Science (Chemistry), Prof.
 Komir L., PhD (Economics), Ass. Prof.
 Malenko E., Doctor of Science (Language), Prof.
 Oberemok S., PhD (Economics), Ass. Prof.
 Palchyk O., PhD (Agricultural Science), Ass. Prof.
 Panfilova A., Doctor of Science (Pharmacy), Prof.
 Podrigalo L., Doctor of Science (Medicine), Prof.
 Rogovoy A., PhD (Economics), Ass. Prof.
 Skrynkovskyy R., PhD (Economics), Ass. Prof.
 Horoshev A., PhD (History), Ass. Prof.
 Shatrovskiy A., PhD (Biology), Ass. Prof.

Editorial office 1:

4B, Južná trieda, Košice mestská časť Juh, 04001, Slovak Republic

Editorial office 2:

2 Club Street, Solonitsevka, 62370, Ukraine

E-mail: editor@pathofscience.org. Site: <http://pathofscience.org>

The journal is an international open-access, peer-reviewed electronic journal created to fully and promptly meet the information needs of the society in the knowledge gained in the course of research and development, research and design, design and technology and production activities of scientists and experts.

The journal publishes original research papers, review articles and short communications papers in the fields of Social, Technical, Natural sciences and Humanities. The scope of problems of articles is not limited.

Responsibility for facts, quotations, private names, enterprises and organizations titles, geographical locations etc. to be barred by the authors. The editorial office and board do not always share the views and thoughts expressed in the articles published.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

SECTION "LANGUAGES"

Natalia Nesterenko

Defining Models of Chronotope in the Creation of Female Characters in Pavlo Zagrebelnyi's Historical Novel "Roksolana"	1001
[Визначальні моделі хронотопу у формуванні жіночих образів в історичному романі Павла Загребельного «Роксолана»]	1007
<i>(Language – Ukrainian)</i>	

Valery Belinska

Expressivity of Peter Perebyinis's Conceptual Metaphor	1008
[Експресивність концептуальної метафори Петра Перебийноса]	1013
<i>(Language – Ukrainian)</i>	

SECTION "ECONOMICS"

Iliyasu Ibrahim, Maryam Salihu Muhammad, Umar Auwal, Daniel Raymond

Perception of Low Income Earners on the Performance of Mortgage Institutions in Housing Finance in Lafia, Nasarawa state, Nigeria	2001
<i>(Language – English)</i>	2011

SECTION "AGRICULTURE"

Eno Joseph Mbang, Michael Chukwuneke Madukwe, Irenonsen Oyaimare Uddin

Infrastructure and Linkage Challenges in the Execution of Agricultural Programmes in Cross River State, Nigeria	3001
<i>(Language – English)</i>	3009

SECTION "LAW"

Zenun Halili

Comparative Analysis of the Situation of Ethnic Minorities in Kosovo and the Republic of North Macedonia	4001
<i>(Language – English)</i>	4011

Визначальні моделі хронотопу у формуванні жіночих образів в історичному романі Павла Загребельного «Роксолана»

Defining Models of Chronotope in the Creation of Female Characters in Pavlo Zagrebelyi's Historical Novel "Roksolana"

Наталя Нестеренко ¹

Natalia Nesterenko

¹ H. S. Skovoroda Kharkiv National Pedagogical University

29 Alchevskyyh Street, Kharkiv, Ukraine

DOI: [10.22178/pos.52-1](https://doi.org/10.22178/pos.52-1)

LCC Subject Category:
PG3801-3987

Received 20.10.2019
Accepted 28.11.2019
Published online 30.11.2019

Corresponding Author:
nattapetta@gmail.com

Анотація. Стаття присвячена зіставленню притаманних жіночим образам історичного роману Павла Загребельного «Роксолана» моделей хронотопу як ідеостилістичних засобів творення системно-структурної, жанрової й ідейної специфіки текстів митця. Досягнення мети передбачає розв'язання завдань: визначити й схарактеризувати специфіку домінуючих моделей хронотопу, які структурують жіночі образи в романі.

Інтерпретація хронотопу через категорію події уможливила введення нами поняття «модель хронотопу», під яким розуміється певна типова подія, яка замальовується в площині одного твору кілька разів у стосунку до різних героїв або того самого героя. Для зображення цієї події автор може обирати різні топосні й хроносні параметри, зберігаючи при цьому інваріантну сутність події. В історичному романі «Роксолана» виразно простежується тенденція до використання письменником типових хронотопів для створення образу людини в історії. Нами було виділено в романі такі центральні моделі хронотопів, як хронотоп боротьби, спокути, перемоги, поразки, втечі, прозріння.

Серед домінуючих моделей хронотопу, які структурують образи Валіде Хафси, Махідеван, Роксолани-Хуррем, переважають спільні моделі: боротьби, перемоги, вознесіння, випробування, зміни (переходу), поразки (падіння), помсти, втрати. Усіх героїнь в історичному романі Павла Загребельного «Роксолана» об'єднує хронотоп боротьби за владу над Сулейманом. Для досягнення своєї мети владні рабині гарему проходять через хронотопи випробування, зміни (переходу), втрат. Моделі перемоги, вознесіння супроводжуються хронотопами поразки, втрати, помсти. Завдяки використаним моделям хронотопу Павла Загребельного вдається створити рельєфні психологічні образи людей XVI століття.

Ключові слова: історичний роман; хронотопна організація; топосні й хроносні параметри; ізоморфний феномен; хронотоп; моделі хронотопу.

Abstract. The article is devoted to the comparison of the chronotope models, characteristic of the female characters of the historical novel "Roksolana" by Pavlo Zagrebelyi as ideostylistic means of creating systemic-structural, genre and ideological specificity of the author's texts. Achieving the goal involves solving the following tasks: identifying and characterizing the specific dominant models of chronotope that structure the female characters in the novel.

The interpretation of the chronotope through the category of event made it possible for us to introduce the concept of "chronotope model", which means a typical event that is depicted in the plane of one work several times in relation to different heroes or the same hero. To represent this event, the author may choose different topographic and chronic parameters, while maintaining the invariant nature of the event. The historical novel "Roksolana" clearly shows the tendency of the writer to use typical chronotopes to create the image of a person in history. We have singled out such central models of chronotopes as the chronotope of struggle, redemption, victory, defeat, escape, insight in the novel.

© 2019 The Author. This article is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License 

Among the dominant models of chronotope that structure the images of Valid Hafsa, Mahidevran, Roksolana-Hurrem, there are some prevailing common models: fights, victories, ascension, trials, changes (transition), defeat (fall), revenge, loss. All the female characters in Pavlo Zagrebelyni's historical novel, "Roksolana" are united by the chronotope of struggle for power over Suleiman. To achieve their goal, the female slaves of the harem go through the chronotopes of trial, change (transition), loss. The models of victory and ascension are accompanied by the chronotopes of defeat, loss, revenge. Thanks to the used models of chronotope, Pavlo Zagrebelyni manages to create the prominent psychological images of people of the sixteenth century.

Keywords: historical novel; chronotope organization; topographic and chronological parameters; isomorphic phenomenon; chronotope; chronotope models.

ВСТУП

Творча спадщина П. Загребельного, зокрема його історична романістика, здобулася на достатньо пильну увагу з боку літературознавців і критики: С. Шаховського, В. Фащенко, В. Чумака, В. Дончика, М. Слабошпицького, М. Жулинського, С. Нестерук, О. Проценко, Н. Сушкевич, В. Сікорської [8]. Одним із актуальних аспектів дослідження історичних творів митця стало вивчення їхньої хронотопної організації, що пояснюється оригінальністю багатьох творів письменника в плані їхніх часопросторових вимірів. Разом із тим підхід, який застосовували науковці-попередники до аналізу історичних творів у визначеній перспективі, не можна вважати задовільним, оскільки застосовувана ними аналітична методика, що спиралася на традиційну, запропоновану й апробовану ще в 30-х рр. ХХ ст. М. Бахтіним [1] при аналізі конкретних текстів певних письменників, не забезпечила цілісного погляду на хронотопну організацію історичних творів П. Загребельного як виразно ізоморфний феномен, зумовлений єдністю авторських інтенцій, своєрідністю історіософської концепції митця, які сприяли актуалізації в романних площинах типових хронотопів, їхнього варіювання й видозміни.

Аналіз творчого шляху митця дозволяє розглядати художній набуток письменника як цілісний феномен, не зважаючи на те, що сформований він творами різних жанрів, різної тематики й виявляє виразні ознаки зміщення авторських смислових і конструктивних акцентів. При цьому, щоправда, творчість митця характеризується амплітудною динамікою, що зокрема вилилося в співіснуванні в доробку П. Загребельного творів як на сучасну, так і на історичну тематику та появу творів, у яких часопросторові виміри сучасності

й історії злилися, переплелися, а також у співіснуванні в спадщині митця творів виразно «традиціоналістських» (соцреалістичних) і виразно модерних (експериментальних, «хімерних») [1].

Еволюція ідейно-тематичних і структурно-композиційних пошуків П. Загребельного раннього періоду вилилася в поступову викристалізацію у творчій манері письменника низки характеристик і прийомів, які стануть визначальними при конструюванні ним текстів 80-90-х рр. ХХ ст. як виразно своєрідних і водночас багато в чому подібних, серед яких: 1) «авантюризація» сюжету; 2) насичення творів інформацією («мозаїчність»); 3) поєднання кількох жанрово-стильових різновидів (реалістичність, психологізм, авантюризм, філософічність тощо) у межах одного твору; 4) зображення непересічних характеристик; 5) використання прийомів іронізації оповіді й умовного письма; 6) намагання забезпечити ефект «нерозривності часів»; 7) орієнтація на «боротьбу з посередністю»; 8) «хімеризація» оповіді та ін. [8]

Хронотоп як літературознавча категорія, що була уведена в широкий науковий обіг М. Бахтіним [1], на сьогодні тлумачиться надзвичайно широко й неоднозначно, що не сприяє проведенню досліджень часопросторових вимірів художніх текстів за уніфікованими методиками. Значною мірою така ситуація зумовлена тим, що дослідники, апелюючи до класичного визначення М. Бахтіна хронотопу як єдності часових і просторових ознак тексту, що структурують його жанрову специфіку, змістову своєрідність, і до визначених видатним науковцем типових хронотопів (дороги, порогу, розлуки та ін.) [1], не зважають на те, що бахтінівська ідея хронотопу фактично не здобулася на чітку теоре-

тичну розробку й не оформилася у викінчену теорію хронотопу, яка б розмежовувала різні типи, види й підвиди хронотопів, визначала їх ієрархію, окреслювала стратегії аналізу тексту в конкретному тексті й методи зіставного вивчення хронотопних характеристик різних текстів тощо. У зв'язку з цим у роботі спираємося на інтерпретації категорії хронотопу в широкому (бахтінівському) сенсі як жанро-, структуро- й смислоутворюючого принципу організації художнього тексту й у вузькому сенсі як часопросторової характеристики подієвого ряду художнього тексту. На підставі цього розрізнення хронотоп у вузькому значенні розглядаємо як категорію передусім структурно-сюжетного рівня й виділяємо хронотопні вияви тексту за єдиним принципом залежно від сутності події, змалюваної в тексті, наприклад, хронотоп зустрічі, пізнання, прозріння, вивищення, боротьби, перемоги, втрати, зневіри тощо. Завдяки цьому вдається уникнути номінативної неоднорідності хронотопів, яка була «породжена» ще М. Бахтіним і фігурує до сьогодні (пор. хронотоп дороги, порогу, кабінету (назви хронотопів за топосами) vs хронотоп зустрічі, випадку, прощання, втрати (назви хронотопів за дією)), ускладнюючи розуміння змісту категорії й унеможливаючи застосування єдиних засад аналізу художніх текстів крізь призму їхніх хронотопних вимірів.

Інтерпретація хронотопу через категорію події уможливила уведення поняття «модель хронотопу», під яким розуміється певна типова подія, яка змалюється в площині одного твору кілька разів у стосунку до різних героїв або того самого героя або в площині різних творів. Для зображення цієї події автор може обирати різні топосні й хроносні параметри, зберігаючи при цьому інваріантну сутність події [1, с. 14].

Метою статті є зіставити притаманні жіночим образам історичного роману П. Загребельного «Роксолана» моделі хронотопу як ідеостилістичні засоби творення системно-структурної, жанрової й ідейної специфіки текстів митця. Досягнення мети передбачає розв'язання завдань: визначити та схарактеризувати специфіку домінантних моделей хронотопу, які структурують жіночі образи в романі.

РЕЗУЛЬТАТИ ДОСЛІДЖЕННЯ

Властиву письменникам форму «вторгнення сучасності в історію та історії в сучасність» В. Дончик назвав «романізованим міфом» чи міфологізованим романом». Яскравим свідченням цього є П. Загребельний із його романами – постать доволі колоритна, характерна [2]. Працюючи над «Роксоланою», письменник керувався тим, що «великі люди нам близькі за близькими нам почуттями і переживаннями» [6]. Цей роман митця покликаний «поєднати історію цієї жінки (Роксолани – примітка автора) з історією її народу з'єднати те, що було так жорстоко й несправедливо роз'єднано, бо зведена до купи доля окремої особи і цілого народу набуває нового виміру» [3], «повернути її психології» [3].

В історичному романі «Роксолана» виразно простежується тенденція до використання письменником типових хронотопів для створення образу людини в історії. Нами було виділено в романі такі центральні моделі хронотопів, як хронотоп боротьби, спокути, перемоги, поразки, втечі, прозріння [7].

Павло Загребельний для характеристики образу Роксолани використав визначальні хронотопи боротьби, перемоги, вознесіння, переходу (зміни), самостворення, поразки, випробування, рішення, помсти, втрати, віднаходження, прозирання, спокути, зради [7].

Хронотопом, що структурує життєвий шлях героїні є хронотоп боротьби за волю, за владу. На думку П. Загребельного, Роксолана «пристала на всі правила гри, які існували в тому світі, згодилася заради власного порятунку, порятунку своєї особистості, бо для цього дозволено все, хоч що б там не казали моралісти» [4]. Доля Роксолани пов'язана із долею Сулеймана й Османської імперії, але має різні вектори руху. Потрапивши до патріархального світу Сходу, Роксолана не впала у відчай, бо в ній перемогла велич, як національна домінанта української душі [4].

Серед жіночих образів у романі, які відігравали важливу роль у житті Сулеймана, варто відзначити Валіде Хафсу, Махідеван, Роксолану-Хуррем. Усіх героїнь об'єднує хронотоп боротьби за владу над Сулейманом. Валіде присвятила життя сину, оскільки він був її єдиним шансом, щоб вижити й вознестися: «Віддала Сулейманові все життя, стемніла устами від багатолітньої зневаги, якої зазна-

вала від Селіма, ... кинула всі сили своєї душі на служіння єдиному сину, вибудовувала споруду свого життя вперто й дбайливо» [5, с. 66]. Один із довірених осіб султана, Ібрагім, уважав, що Хафса має владу над сином таємничу й необмежену й посперечатися за цей вплив над розумом і серцем Володаря Віку могла тільки суперниця найстрашніша – держава. У боротьбі за владу над Сулейманом Валіде не могла поклатися на волю долі чи випадку, тому вирішила знайти жінку з племені черкесів майбутньому султану особисто: «По матері вона черкешенка, тому намірилася розбудити в синові мужчину, знайшовши для нього гідну жону з свого племені. Жінці майже завжди вдається зробити задумане. Останні три роки Сулейман поволі ставав рабом гарему. Бо там з'явилася Махідеврэн» [5, с. 65]. Поява Махідеврэн у гаремі змусила забути нащадка Селіма про стриманість і настороженість до всього, що так чи інакше зазіхало на його свободу. «Вона стала султаншею, перш ніж Султан – султаном. Така царська хода була в неї, такі погляди, такий голос» [5, с. 68]. Для змалювання образу Роксолани актуальним є хронотоп боротьби, що структурує першу книгу роману «Вознесіння». Реконструюючи «страдницьке життя» Роксолани, П. Загребельний обумовлює специфіку творення образу дівчини-бранки: «У Роксолани не було ангела-рятівника. Вимушена була стати ангелом для себе сама» [4].

Шлях до перемоги й вознесіння героїнь супроводжуються хронотопами переходу й випробування. Валіде Хафса, яка походила з роду кримських Гіреїв, десятиліттями змушена була терпіти зневагу від Селіма, мандруючи зі своїм сином то в Амасію, то в Крим, то в Едірне чи в Манісу, але не зневірилася: «У її жилах не було крові Османів. Але вознесена нині на становище хранительки чеснот і гідностей цього царського роду, вона щосили намагалася увібрати в себе його багатовіковий дух» [5, с. 55].

Для Махідеврэн випробування долі почалося зі знайомства з Сулейманом: «Її привезено для втіхи цьому високому понурому султанському синові, нею горде її плем'я вклонялося майбутньому султанові, її кинуто в бурхливу гірську річку в сподіванні, що вибереться на берег без нічиєї помочі, послано в пащу левчукові з вірою в те, що не дасть вона себе проковтнути, а стане левицею так само хижою» [5, с. 68]. У якості способу, щоб здобути

прихильність спадкоємця трону, героїня, обирає «гордість, ховаючись за яку, можна досягти всього на світі» [5, с. 68]. Хронотоп переходу, що супроводжує становлення Господині Віку, починається зі зміни імені, яке вона отримала від Валіде. Хафса, вражена красою черкешенки, з першої хвилини знайомства називає її Гюльбахар – Весняна троянда. Після прибуття до Стамбула, коли Сулейман сів на трон Османів, гаремна улюблениця отримала ім'я відповідно до становища – Махідеврэн, тобто Господиня Віку. Колишня гордість дівчини з дикого гірського племені перетворилася на султанську гордість – пиху й величання.

Махідеврэн перемогла (хронотоп перемоги), утвердившись не лише в серці Сулеймана, а й ставши законною дружиною – баш-кадиною після народження чотирьох дітей: «Прибула до Стамбула повновладною султаншою, уже не було в ній пам'яті про свій далекий і, власне, убогий рід, бо дала початок пишному родові султанському, не знала вона, що таке розум для неї, бо могла замінити його всемогутньою державою; не дбала про душу, маючи неподільну владу; була чужа милосердю, заклопотана тільки роздаванням повелінь» [5, с. 69].

Успадкування трону Османів возвеличило не тільки дружину Сулеймана, а й матір – Валіде. Для Хафси точки безмежного простору Османської імперії: Крим, Едірне, Стамбул, Маніса з'єдналися й об'єднали всі простори в столиці, «у царственому Стамбулі, у палаці Топкапи, де упокоїено сіла вона на подушку почесні й поваги, ставши тугрою на султанській грамоті гідностей найцотливіших людей усього світу» [5, с. 55].

Хронотоп боротьби Роксолани реалізується в замкнених топосах гарему, хамаму, палацу Топкапи, що асоціювався з неволею, загрозою, ненавистю: «Тут не знали любові, а тільки ненависть до могили, тут навіть з найбільшого пониження зазіхали на все найсвятіше, готові були на будь-яку підлість, щоб повалити найбільше, помсту плекали в душах, мов екзотичні рослини в садах ...» [5, с. 192]. Хронотопи боротьби й перемоги, що визначають образ Роксолани, тісно пов'язані з хронотопом переходу (зміни). Саме для боротьби з ненавистю, обмеженістю і для захисту себе, щоб вижити в нетрях гарему, Настя обирає

смій. Метаморфози починаються зі зміною імені: героїня стає Хуррем – розвеселена.

Поява нової одаліски ще нікому не віщувала лиха: ні Валіде Хафсі, ні султанським сестрам, ні старшому євнухові, чорношкірому кизляр-азі, ні всемогутній Махідеврэн. Спроби завойовувати прихильність, утримувати владу над Сулейманом для головних жінок імперії увінчалися успіхом: обидві стали повноправними господинями серця й гарему султана. Водночас через хронотоп прозирання (віщування) П. Загребельний уводить мотив загрози як інваріантну модель хронотопу випробування: «А тим часом ховалася в ньому загроза, як у всьому незвичайному, бо незвичне ламає усталений лад, а це неминуче веде за собою нещастя для когось, надто для жінок, які усе своє життя витрачають на відчайдушні зусилля дати бодай якийсь лад тій суміші хаосу й випадковостей, з яких складається, власне, життя, коли на нього поглянути оком неупередженим і нечоловічим» [5, с. 70].

Загроза таїлася не тільки в появі нової гаремниці, а й у тих випадковостях, над якими героїні не мали влади. Смерть трьох дітей Махідеврэн, підсилена втратою любові Сулеймана до баш-кадин, стала причиною того, що «короткі роки її величання скінчилися без вороття» [5, с. 102].

Змагаючись за прихильність султана, Хуррем приймає рішення (хронотоп рішення) за будь-яку ціну піднятися над усіма й над усім, бо «раби хоч і нижчі за тиранів, зате стоять на власних ногах, а тирані – на глиняних. Вона переможе цього чоловіка, має перемогти будь-що» [5, с. 129].

Відчуваючи загрозу для свого становища, Валіде вирішила втрутитися в перебіг змагань за безроздільне панування над душею сина між Хуррем і Махідеврэн: «... покликала до себе Махідеврэн, нагримала на неї за безконечне рюмсання, відкрила їй очі на загрозу, розпалила в черкешенці дику лють ...» [5, с. 131]. Засліплена горем і помстою (хронотоп помсти) баш-кадина вривається до нової наложниці в покої: «Всією тяжкістю перегородованого тіла вдарила Махідеврэн знетямлену Хуррем, уп'яла свої гострі нігті їй в лице, учепилася у волосся» [5, с. 133]. Гарем спостерігав за цією подією, сподіваючись побачити падіння рабині, «яка замахнулася на найвище» (інваріант хронотопу поразки). Уперше в османських гаремах рабиня відмовлялася йти

на поклик падишаха, вимовляючи погордливі слова, вихваляючись рабством як найбільшою цнотою. Проте страхітливе падіння чекало не на Хуррем, а на Повелительку Віку. Сподівання Топкапи не справдилося: возвеличення тих, хто чекав на кінець «тимчасової улюблениці», Валіде, Махідеврэн, султанських сестер не відбулося: «Кизляр-ага слухняно пішов у новий похід. Одну вже звів на вершину, тепер другу мав спустити до низин» [5, с. 133]. Хронотоп падіння колишньої Володарки Віку супроводжувався повним забуттям: «Султан прогнав Махідеврэн з-перед очей, мов наупослідженішу рабиню, він не хотів бачити її не тільки в своїй ложниці, а й у гаремі, і не тільки в Баб-ус-сааде, а й у Стамбулі» [5, с. 138].

Невдовзі Валіде переконалася, що рабиня з України найнебезпечніша суперниця не тільки всім одаліскам, а й «повелительці гарему і свого єдиного сина» [5, с. 136]. Відчуваючи загрозу в Хуррем, Хафса намагалася непомітно керувати вихованням роксоланки, але її хитрощі звелися нанівець. Протистояння двох жінок за владу над Сулейманом тривало до смерті Валіде, яка померла, «зруйнована, задущена власною злістю» [5, с. 259], після чого Хуррем змогла стати офіційною дружиною Володаря Віку.

Хронотоп перемоги Роксолана в розділі «Плаття» має інваріант хронотопу вознесіння: «тепер вона ждала своєї перемоги ще з більшим нетерпінням, ніж Сулейман під стінами Родосу, ждала вознесіння і повнилася силою, пихою і відвагою, якої ще не знала в собі» [5, с. 158].

Народження сина Мехмеда стало перемогою Хуррем, про що повідомили барабани за брамою Баб-ус-сааде: «Барабан за Брамою блаженства бив гучно і радісно, мов її серце він бив переможно, бо це була її перемога» [5, с. 162]. Свідченням перемоги став титул султанши Хасекі й участь у прийомі на честь перемоги рицарів Родосу в Тронному залі, де вперше в історії Османської імперії: «ще вчора незнана рабиня, сьогодні всевладна повелителька, наближена й вознесена небувало» [5, с. 165], була допущена до трону.

Отримавши владу, Хуррем вирішує (хронотоп рішення) помститися світові за всі кривди: «нічого не має крім влади й має помститися цьому жорстокому світові тільки владою» [5,

с. 265] (хронотоп помсти), бо в світі Османів знають тільки ненависть і владу.

Першим кому помстилася Хасекі став Чотириокий – кизляр-ага, який був спільником Валіде, бачив ганьбу й триумф рабині. Хронотоп помсти Роксолани визначає топос ненависті, бо героїня мала багато ворогів: сестри султана, Валіде, Ібрагім.

У книзі першій «Вознесіння» за допомогою хронотопу боротьби П. Загребельний показує як Хуррем рятує власне життя, душу, бореться за те, щоб не втратити людської подобу, зберегти свою особистість. Після цього прагне вознесіння над ницістю світу, над підніжками султанського трону, може, і над самим султаном.

Книга друга «Страсті» присвячена боротьбі Роксолани за життя й майбутнє дітей. Після п'ятнадцяти років у гаремі героїня зрозуміла (хронотоп прозріння), що для свого майбутнього й майбутнього дітей має ще менше часу, ніж до того.

ВИСНОВКИ

Отже, зіставивши притаманні жіночим образам історичного роману П. Загребельного

«Роксолана» моделі хронотопу як ідеостилістичні засоби творення системно-структурної, жанрової й ідейної специфіки текстів митця, нами було схарактеризовано їхню специфіку. Серед домінуючих моделей хронотопу, які структурують образи Валіде Хафси, Махідеван, Роксолани-Хуррем, переважають спільні моделі: боротьби, перемоги, вознесіння, випробування, зміни (переходу), поразки (падіння), помсти, втрати. Усіх героїнь в історичному романі П. Загребельного «Роксолана» об'єднує хронотоп боротьби за владу над Сулейманом. Для досягнення своєї мети владні рабині гарему проходять через хронотопи випробування, зміни (переходу), втрат. Моделі перемоги, вознесіння супроводжуються хронотопами поразки, втрати, помсти. Завдяки використаним моделям хронотопу П. Загребельному вдається створити рельєфні психологічні образи людей XVI століття.

Перспективним видається здійснити порівняльний аналіз моделей хронотопу чоловічих образів у романі «Роксолана», що вможливить формування цілісного погляду на історичну романістику митця як на репрезентацію динамічної концептуальної авторської візії людини в історії.

СПИСОК ВИКОРИСТАНИХ ДЖЕРЕЛ / REFERENCES

1. Bahtin, M. (2000). *Jepos i roman* [Epic and novel]. Sankt-Peterburg: Azbuka (in Russian) [Бахтин, М. (2000). *Епос и роман*. Санкт-Петербург: Азбука].
2. Donchyk, V. (1984). *Istyna – osobystist (Proza Pavla Zahrebelnoho)* [The Truth is the Personality (Paul Zagrebel's Prose)]. Kyiv: Radianskyi pysmennyk (in Ukrainian) [Дончик, В. (1984). *Істина – особистість (Проза Павла Загребельного)*. Київ: Радянський письменник].
3. Zahrebelnyi, P. (1988). *Vtishannia istoriieiu. Avtorske pisliaslovo* [A comforting story. Author's afterword]. In P. Zahrebelnyi, *Roksolana* (p. 593–600). Kyiv: Dnipro (in Ukrainian) [Загребельний, П. (1988). *Втішання історією. Авторське післяслово*. В П. Загребельний, *Роксолана* (с. 593–600). Київ: Дніпро].
4. Zahrebelnyi, P. (2008). *Dumky narozkhryst, 1974–2003* [Thoughts on the Cross, 1974–2003]. Kyiv: Pulsary (in Ukrainian) [Загребельний, П. (2008). *Думки на розхрист, 1974–2003*. Київ: Пульсари].
5. Zahrebelnyi, P. (1988). *Roksolana* [Roxolana]. Kyiv: Dnipro (in Ukrainian) [Загребельний, П. (1988). *Роксолана*. Київ: Дніпро].
6. Zahrebelnyi, P. (2004). *Ya obyрав velyki dushi, yaki siaiut nam tysiacholittia* [I have chosen the great souls who shine through us for millennia]. *Vitchyzna*, 7-8, 90–98 (in Ukrainian) [Загребельний, П. (2004). *Я обираю великі душі, які сяють нам тисячоліття*. *Вітчизна*, 7-8, 90–98].

7. Nesterenko, N. (2014). Dominantni khronotopy v istorychnomu romani P. Zahrebelnoho "Roksolana" [The dominant chronotopes in P. Zagrebely's historical novel, "Roksolan"]. *Naukovi zapysky Kharkivskoho natsionalnoho pedahohichnoho universytetu im. H.S. Skovorody. Serii: Literaturoznavstvo*, 2(78), 104–115 (in Ukrainian)
[Нестеренко, Н. (2014). Домінантні хронотопи в історичному романі П. Загребельного «Роксолана». *Наукові записки Харківського національного педагогічного університету ім. Г.С. Сковороди. Серія: Літературознавство*, 2(78), 104–115].
8. Nesterenko, N. (2015). *Modeli khronotopu v istorychnykh romanakh Pavla Zahrebelnoho 1980-90-tykh rokiv* [Chronotope models in the historical novels of Paul Zagrebely 1980-90's] (Doctoral thesis). Kharkiv (in Ukrainian)
[Нестеренко, Н. (2015). *Моделі хронотопу в історичних романах Павла Загребельного 1980-90-х років* (Автореферат кандидатської дисертації). Харків].

Експресивність концептуальної метафори Петра Перебийноса

Expressivity of Peter Perebyinis's Conceptual Metaphor

Валерія Белінська¹

Valery Belinska

¹ H. S. Skovoroda Kharkiv National Pedagogical University

29 Alchevskiyh Street, Kharkiv, Ukraine

DOI: 10.22178/pos.52-2

LCC Subject Category:
PG3801-3987

Received 20.10.2019
Accepted 28.11.2019
Published online 30.11.2019

Corresponding Author:
valerybelinska@gmail.com

© 2019 The Author. This article is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License 

Анотація. У статті проаналізовано ознаки експресивності у творах українського поета Петра Перебийноса, зокрема в метафоричних конструкціях, які репрезентують його ідіостиль. Представлено такі риси поетової мови, як кінематографічність, метафоричність, динамізм, тематична опозиційність, казковість, контрастивність опису, а також уживання сленгових одиниць. Усі вони є складниками метафоричних конструкцій, що створюють експресію в описі почуттів ліричного героя.

Ключові слова: Петр Перебийніс; метафорична конструкція; динаміка; статика; контраст; кінематографічність.

Abstract. The article analyzes the signs of expressiveness in the works of the Ukrainian poet P. Perebyinis, in particular in the metaphorical constructions that represent his ideostyle. The features of the poetic language, such as cinematography, metaphoricity, dynamism, thematic opposition, fabulosity, contrast of description, and the use of slang units are presented. They are all constituents of metaphorical constructions that create expression in describing the feelings of a lyrical hero.

Keywords: Peter Perebyinis; metaphorical construction; dynamics; statics; contrast; cinematography.

ВСТУП

У поетичному мистецтві важливим є зворотній ефект – сприйняття поезії читачем (слухачем), який має або звірити свої думки з поетовими, або за допомогою автора відкрити для себе новий світ. Цей ефект створюється за допомогою стилістичних елементів безпосереднього впливу – візуальності, динамічності, контрасту, антитези, гіперболи тощо. Тобто мова поета спрямована на розуміння реципієнтом його мотивів, системи духовних цінностей, загалом мовної картини світу (далі – МКС). При цьому справжній поет не підлаштовується під рівень читача (слухача) – він намагається залучити останнього до свого метафоричного світу.

Українські вчені активно досліджують ідіостиль авторів художніх текстів, зважаючи й на засоби формування в них ознак експресивності. Так, І. Голубовська зазначає цю рису як провідну ознаку концептуальної метафори. За її словами, саме оцінно-

експресивна метафора «відіграє значну роль у конституюванні мовних картин світу. Зберігаючи яскраву образність, підкріплену прозорістю внутрішньої форми, оцінно-експресивна метафора завжди емоційно насичена та стилістично маркована. Вона насамперед спрямована на формування в адресата емоційно-оцінного ставлення до позначуваного» [3, с. 184]. Компонент «оцінний» у такому разі стосується того різновиду емоцій, які виникають під час сприйняття певного явища, – зокрема пестливість, принизливість, презирство, схвальність тощо. У свою чергу оцінно-експресивна метафора може породжувати стереотипи – «еталонні національно-культурні уявлення (образи), що відіграють величезну роль у продукуванні мовою вторинного символічного простору», формування якого значною мірою належить до компетенції колективного (етнічного) підвідомого [3, с. 184]. Н. Бондар говорить про гностико-асоціативно-оцінні параметри ет-

нічної мовної свідомості, оскільки оцінно-експресивна метафора породжує усталені етноментальні уявлення, завдяки яким мова продукує вторинний символічний простір [1, с. 173–174]. За словами А. Мойсієнка, автор із метафор складає систему внутрішніх знакових елементів тексту [6, с. 12], тобто останній не може бути без ознак експресивності. Хоча, з іншого боку, опису сільського життя, за словами М. Максюті, властиві статичні риси – узвичаєність, постійність, усталеність тощо [3, с. 110]. А це саме сфера поета, мову якого ми проаналізуємо в цій статті.

Таким чином, метою статті визначаємо дослідження рис експресивності у творах українського поета Петра Перебийноса. Завдання статті: проаналізувати особливості поетової кінематографічності, зокрема візуальні, колористичні, а також динамізм, визначити тематичну опозиційність, риси казковості, контрастивності опису, авторської метафоричності, а також уживання сленгових одиниць.

Відповідно до такої мети серед характеристик означеного митця відзначаємо насамперед його щирість і чутливість, особливо стосовно рідної землі, отчого краю та духовних колізій сучасної цивілізації. Він гостро сприймає екологічні негаразди, агресивний вплив урбаністики на сільську природу, історичні біди рідного народу. Недарма про поезію Петра Перебийноса Д. Павличко зазначає, що це «сповідь мученика, якого терзає усвідомлення втрати свого найдорожчого, зраженого словечка» [7, с. 10], а інші дослідники стверджують, що поет належить до тих митців, які опираються «на глибину історії народу, його духовність і незнищену совість» [14, с. 12].

РЕЗУЛЬТАТИ ДОСЛІДЖЕННЯ

Кінематографічні риси поезій П. Перебийноса зумовлені тим, що митець має і художницький талант, а тому ландшафтний опис відбувається через призму сприйняття пейзажиста, маніфестованого виразними візуальними елементами. Це особливо виявляється в таких фрагментах: «*Сніжний вечір. Біла тиша. // Сині сутінки галяв. // І довершеність готична // срібно-*

кутого гілля» [12, с. 475] (ознаки візуальності – виділені прикметники, переважно колористичні); «*Висока готика тополі. // Тонке мереживо гілля*» [12, с. 477] (ознаки візуальності – метафоричні означальні словосполучення, що маніфестують архітектурні елементи); «*Хрестами перетнулися орбіти та річки. // Небесне око хмуриться і дивиться на хрест*» [12, с. 484] (ознака візуальності – виділена метафорична конструкція, інша – домислена автором через віртуальний елемент *небесне око*). При цьому колористичні елементи можуть маніфестувати поєднання контрастних кольорів: «*Синя вирва, нитка золота*» [12, с. 457].

«Картинність» ландшафтного опису поет навіть конкретизує відповідними іменниками: «*Картина осені готова. // Жаріє охра. Фіолетом // цвіте прозора акварель*» [9, с. 219]. Виділені ознаки – терміни зображального мистецтва – динамізуються елементами живої природи (*фіолетом цвіте*). Цей колір зустрічаємо в поезії «Картопля цвіте фіолетово...», де автор змальовує невеличкі картинки – зображення на маминому вишиванні, що забарвлені у казковий фіолетовий колір, оскільки саме такими нитками мама вишиває: «*цілується джмелик із мальвою*», «*гойдається сонце на соняху*». Ці метафори відтворюють ще й певний казковий ефект, оскільки «*мама землю одягає у святешну вишиванку з фіолетовою маніжкою*» (виділена метафора свідчить про духовне значення матері. Ще: «*картопля цвіте фіолетово між мамою та Україною*») [11, с. 96].

Такий опис цікавий насамперед колористичним спрямуванням, коли автор не робить жодного розрізнення в кольорах, ніби перебуваючи уві сні. В іншій поезії – «Рожевий страх» – він конструє світ уже в рожевому кольорі: «*рожеве море конюшини*», «*полінна сіль припорошила рожеві дні*» [10, с. 101]. Загалом таке акцентування на колористичних елементах у складі метафоричних конструкцій створює експресію ландшафтного опису.

Динамічність частіше властива наративним поезіям, де наявні певні дії чи процес. Так, описуючи укладання асфальту, автор називає результат цієї дії «*могильною плитою*» (у поета часто семантика бетону характери-

зує урбаністичний опис). Цю «плиту» **проломлює** сміливий зухвалий росточок, що «не помер під пресом гарячим» і «**розростається далі і далі відчайдушний, чіпкий подорожник**». Виділені дієслова є, по-перше, динамічними, а по-друге – позитивними, опозиційними елементами до негативних, що в поета апіорі характеризують місто. Зрештою, від цих дій відбувається метаморфоза із самим асфальтом – «вулканічний окріп смоли» стає іншим – «**набухає, тріщить від коріння, // зеленіє родючий асфальт**» [11, с. 94]. Виділені динамічні дієслова вказують на невблаганність природного розквіту, що конкретизується у прагненні рослин (росточка) до життя.

Тематичні опозиції «село – місто» та тотожні з нею «природа – людина», «мир – війна», «живе – мертве» тощо ми виділяємо як одні з головних у тематичній площині ідіостилю П. Перебийноса. Наприклад, елементи сільської природи виявляють позитивну картину: «**За селом риплять тополі, // степ видніє звідсіля, // Згасли соняхи сторогі, // серпень гречку змолотив**» (більшість виділених дієслів є динамічними). У темпоральному аспекті так позначаються межі «осінь – зима», коли вже **згасли соняхи та серпень гречку змолотив**, а також **ще віночків осінь гожа з наречених не зніма**, а зимові характеристики автор асоціює з ядерною загрозою: «**І не віриться, що може бути атомна зима**» [11, с. 106].

У поезії «Таємниця води», де описано ознаки колишнього водного джерела, автор часто використовує метафоричні конструкції як контрастові показники опозиції «живе – мертве». Наприклад: «**У джерелищах мочарних // струменіли чисті соки. // А тепер, мов яничари, // будяки стоять високі**» [9, с. 156]. Маніфестант «мертвого» компонента (друге з виділених словосполучень) у цьому разі набуває глибшої семантики, аніж просто фізичний показник наявності будяків, – і саме через порівняння з яничарами, що негативно конотоване (як ознака «мертвості»).

Живі ознаки поет традиційно виявляє не лише в метафоричному зіставленні з орнітологічними елементами («**А душа курличе у самотині**» [12, с. 456], де означений пташиний звук зіставляється з мінорним ста-

ном душі – у самотині), але й флористичними (цьому навіть присвячено збірку «Цивілізація дерев»). Так, дубок у нього зрештою набуває ознак вічного життя: «**і став вічним // дубок маленький, три листки**» [8, с. 37] (окрім виділеної метафоричної ознаки, у цьому фрагменті присутня потрійна літота, репрезентована зменшеною формою іменника, відповідним узгодженим означенням і відокремленим неузгодженим).

Ознака казковості виявляється переважно в конкретних наративних поезіях із казковим сюжетом. Так, у поезії «Ми ходили з татом на баштан» автор асоціює баштан із незнайомою галактикою, де «**розкотилися жовто-зелені глобуси кавунів**», де «**кружеляла земля**», «**кружеляли кавуни**», і ті кавуни «**могли б розлетітися в космосі, // якби не були прив'язані до землі // пересохлими пуповинами. // І кружеляли кавуни // з теплою планетою, // як тимчасові її супутники**» [11, с. 68]. Виділені елементи й ознаки космічного світу складають метафоричні конструкції з лексемою кавуни, однак присутня й тема прив'язаності до землі (якби не були **прив'язані до землі**).

Ця прив'язаність становить узагалі одну з виразних рис ідіостилю П. Перебийноса, де образні площини «земля – космос» своїми елементами зіставляються у складі метафоричних конструкцій. Це відзначив і Д. Павличко через вислів «погляд з вічності» [7, с. 9]. Причому такі зіставлення виявляють часом дуже оригінальні паралелі – наприклад, «кавуни – Космос»: «**Моститься сонечко на сон // десь там, за кавунами. // І марить сонний патисон // далекими вогнями**», де виділена сполука позначає не лише межі горизонту, але й астральне значення поля, на якому й інші рослини віртуально пов'язані з Космосом (**патисон марить далекими вогнями**). І навпаки – рослинний елемент стає в поета частиною Космосу: «**пливе окрасць кавуна // в рожевому тумані**» [12, с. 427] (у виділеній метафорі зіставляється місяць зі скибкою / **окрайцем кавуна**). Тобто ознаки метафоричності та казковості поєднуються в таких описах, виявляючи як авторські інтенції, так і суспільні.

У наведених вище фрагментах відзначаються й елементи контрасту, адже і колористи-

чні протиставлення (*синє – біле*), і речовинні (*мертвий асфальт – живий росточок*), і метафоричні (*кавуни – супутники*) спрямовані на ефективний вплив на реципієнта. Принагідно слід навести слова Д. Павличка щодо метафор П. Перебийноса: «володіє власним і надзвичайно сильним метафоричним мисленням» [7, с. 5]. Наприклад, у строфі «*Коли серпанок вереснів // і спотикався на підкові, // ішов степами Словосій // у вишиванці волошковій*» [9, с. 135] виділені дієслова складають основу метафоричних конструкцій, які разом з образною ознакою, маніфестованою епітетним словосполученням у вишиванці волошковій формують ірреальний опис певного часового періоду, конкретизованого дієсловом *вереснів*.

Поету властиві також оригінальні порівняння – наприклад, жінки з птахом – через метафори «*забриніло біле пір'я*» та «*сіла паморозь на крила*» з часовою ознакою похилого віку «*біле – паморозь*», а ще далі – знову з бджілкою в тому ж часовому вимірі: «*Біла бджілка. // Пізній мед*» [11, с. 84] з відповідними за семантикою епітетами *біла, пізній*. Такі поєднання колористичних і часових ознак, зіставляваних з орнітологічними та ентомологічними, властиве пізньому періоду творчості поета з домінуванням мінорних елементів.

Ознаками експресивної інтимної поезії визначаємо семантичні елементи горіння, що створюють експресію в описі почуттів кохання ліричного героя. Це виявляється у відповідних епітетах і метафорах: «*жагучі уста*», «*вогнище любові*», «*пали мене устами*», «*від ніжності згорю*» [8, с. 58], у яких переважає семантика горіння / згоряння в різноманітних граматичних формах – прикметників, дієслів й іменників. Зауважимо при тому, що серед дієслів використано навіть форми наказового способу (*пали*), які виражають найвищий рівень інтимності в поезії. Щодо вогняної (спопеляючої) характеристики кохання поет вживає навіть порівняння його з динамітом («*кохання – грудка динаміту*»), що чатує на момент спалаху – від наповнених семантикою смутку прикметників-епітетів («*пекучий згусток болю*», «*уста німі, зів'ялі*», «*слова терпкі, слова забуті*», «*похмурі дні, безсонні ночі*»)

– до антитезного епітета *весела* («*весела іскорка тріскаче // на грудці динаміту*» [8, с. 60]).

Як маніфестанти сучасності в мові П. Перебийноса визначаються окремі сленгові одиниці, що не так давно увійшли в українську мову. Наприклад, у фрагменті «*Б'ють по своїх, бо душить жаба*» [12, с. 411] виділене загальновідоме словосполучення ідіоматично позначає почуття заздрості, яким поет характеризує критикованих ним осіб, що ще й *б'ють по своїх* (ще один фразеологізм на позначення негативних відносин між людьми). Активновживаним у 90-ті роки став і прикметник *рокований* («*неминучий, невідворотний, фатальний*» [13, с. 874]). У поета: «*Роковані душі // в лабетах біди*» [12, с. 448] (тобто *біда* для них – невідворотна).

Експресивність поетичної мови митця виявляється і в емоційних звертаннях автора до негативного персонажа, що властиве його поезіям 90-х років. Наприклад: «*Ницый рабе // метушні і суєти! // Ось твій рай! // І чудесам // тут повіриш не даремно. // Бо у лісі ти не сам. // Біля тебе – ці дерева*» [12, с. 460]. Виділені словосполучення виявляють відповідне ставлення поета – як до людини, яка не розуміє реальної сутності життя – єднання з природою, що маніфестується як справжній *рай* (*ліс, дерева*). Недарма й назва збірки – «*Цивілізація дерев*» (*цивілізація* – це «рівень суспільного розвитку і матеріальної культури, досягнутий певною суспільно-економічною формацією» [2, с. 1582]). Зрештою символіку сучасної епохи поет визначає у фрагменті «*Зірки там і хрест. // І трохи // блакиті... Портрет // епохи*» [12, с. 469], де виділені відомі опозиційні політичні символи, які репрезентують дві протилежні орієнтації українського народу, мають мінорну характеристику, однак поряд визначаємо й мажорну, маніфестовану словосполученням *трохи блакиті*, що позначає мирну природу та, можливо, навіть європейську демократію.

У межах опозиції «урбаністичне – природне» П. Перебийніс надає перевагу другому компоненту, пов'язуючи його з рідним селом, українським ландшафтом, представниками місцевої флори й фауни. Так, у поезії «*Зелена музика*» автор також зачіпає означену тематику, описуючи «музику лісу», яку

він відчуває в хашах, де «живе **трава сто-жильна**», де «лиш **коники-гульвіси** переплигують стежини», де «напинає **липа** крону-парасолю», де «мелодія **сунічна**» та «радіолу пня торкає гострим дзьобиком **синичка**». Виділені нами позитивні атрибути лісу зіставляються поетом із негативними міськими – «тут **каміння** не гуркоче», «**люте слово** не вбиває», «усі свої **гіркоти** втішне серце забуває». Ознаку втішне сприймаємо як «втішене», оскільки «ліс проміння **пересіяв**» «на добро і на здоров'я» [11, с. 95], тобто відбулася знову таки метаморфоза, відображена у виділеному дієслові через префікс *пере-* зі значенням «перетворення, зміни» ще від індоєвропейської мовної спільноти [4, с. 338–339].

Зрештою, усі авторські пріоритети зумовлені його індивідуальною МКС, серед найбільш частотних елементів якої виділяємо образ рідної хати, що часто асоціюється з матір'ю: «Тільки біла наша **хата** // **дивиться** на шлях» [12, с. 462] (обов'язкова ознака цієї хати – *білий* колір і пов'язаність зі *шляхом*); «Її **коси** тремтячий **ніж**» [9, с. 57] (обов'язкова ознака матері – *коса*, що або асоціюється з сивим кольором, або виявляє інші фізичні ознаки – наприклад, *тремтіння*). Хата позначається й конкретними люд-

ськими ознаками: «*Сталевим громом вік ракетний // стрясає хату білолицю*» [10, с. 9] (прикметник у виділеному словосполученні в українському фольклорі традиційно позначає дівчину, однак образ хати в цьому контексті має ширшу семантику – аж до позначення всього рідного краю й навіть світу, що відчуває загрозу воєнної катастрофи). Відзначаємо також часову маркованість поетичного фрагменту через приядерний елемент *вік*.

ВИСНОВКИ

Проаналізувавши ознаки експресивності у метафорах П. Перебийноса, можемо зробити відповідні висновки: такими ознаками визначено кінематографічні, що репрезентовані візуальними, зокрема колористичними, елементами, динамічні, репрезентовані відповідними дієсловами, контрастивність опису, виявлену в колористичних і предметних опозиціях, тематичну опозиційність, де базовим є протиставлення «урбаністичне – природне», риси казковості, уживання сленгових одиниць. Усі вони є складниками метафоричних конструкцій, що створюють експресію в описі почуттів ліричного героя.

СПИСОК ВИКОРИСТАНИХ ДЖЕРЕЛ / REFERENCES

1. Bondar, N. (2018). *Bazovi kontsepty ukrainskoi mentalnosti u tvorchosti brativ Tiutiunnykiv* [Basic Concepts of Ukrainian Mentality in Tiutiunyk Brothers' Works] (Doctoral dissertation). Poltava – Zaporizhzhia (in Ukrainian)
[Бондар, Н. (2018). *Базові концепти української ментальності у творчості братів Тютюнників* (Кандидатська дисертація). Полтава – Запоріжжя].
2. Busel, V. (Ed.). (2003). *Velykyi tlumachnyi slovnyk suchasnoi ukrainskoi movy* [A great explanatory dictionary of modern Ukrainian]. Kyiv: Perun (in Ukrainian)
[Бусел, В. (Ред.). (2003). *Великий тлумачний словник сучасної української мови*. Київ: Перун].
3. Holubovska, I. (2004). *Etnospetsyfichni konstanty movnoi svidomosti* [Ethno-specific constants of linguistic consciousness] (Doctoral dissertation). Kyiv (in Ukrainian)
[Голубовська, І. (2004). *Етноспецифічні константи мовної свідомості* (Докторська дисертація). Київ].
4. Boldyrev, R. (Ed.). (2003). *Etymologichnyi slovnyk ukrainskoi movy* [Etymological dictionary of the Ukrainian language] (Vol. 4). Kyiv: Naukova dumka (in Ukrainian)
[Болдирев, Р. (Ред.). (2003). *Етимологічний словник української мови* (Т. 4). Київ: Наукова думка].
5. Maksyuta, M. (2003). "Khiborobskyi" povorot u svitohliadnii svidomosti na porozi tretoho tysiacholittia: "heorhiky dushi" dlia hlobalizovanoho liudstva. In *Liudyna i kultura v umovakh hlobalizatsii* (p. 145–155). Kyiv: Parapan (in Ukrainian)

- [Максюта, М. (2003). «Хліборобський» поворот у світоглядній свідомості на порозі третього тисячоліття: «георгіки душі» для глобалізованого людства. В *Людина і культура в умовах глобалізації* (с. 145–155). Київ: Парапан].
6. Moisiienko, A. (2008). *Mova yak svit svitiv. Poetyka tekstovyykh struktur* [Language as a world of worlds. Poetics of textual structures]. Uman (in Ukrainian)
[Мойсієнко, А. (2008). *Мова як світ світів. Поетика текстових структур*. Умань].
7. Pavlychko, D. (2011). *Pohliad z vichnosti. Svit poezii Petra Perebyinosa* [A look from eternity. The World of Poetry by Peter Perebynos]. In P. Perebyinis, *Tsyvilizatsiia derev* (p. 5–11). Kyiv: Ukrainskyi pysmennyk (in Ukrainian)
[Павличко, Д. (2011). Погляд з вічності. Світ поезій Петра Перебийноса. В П. Перебийніс, *Цивілізація дерев* (с. 5–11). Київ: Український письменник].
8. Perebyinis, P. (1979). *Nebo tvoie i zemlia: Poezii* [Heaven and earth: Poetry]. Kyiv : Molod (in Ukrainian)
[Перебийніс, П. (1979). *Небо твоє і земля: Поезії*. Київ : Молодь].
9. Perebyinis, P. (2005). *Pshenychnyi hodynnyk* [Wheat clock]. Kyiv : VIK (in Ukrainian)
[Перебийніс, П. (2005). *Пшеничний годинник*. Київ : ВІК].
10. Perebyinis, P. (1976). *Rankovi surmy: Poezii* [Morning Antimony: Poetry]. Kyiv : Radianskyi pysmennyk (in Ukrainian)
[Перебийніс, П. (1976). *Ранкові сурми: Поезії*. Київ : Радянський письменник].
11. Perebyinis, P. (1990). *Tochnyi chas: Poezii* [Time: Poetry]. Kyiv : Radianskyi pysmennyk (in Ukrainian)
[Перебийніс, П. (1990). *Точний час: Поезії*. Київ : Радянський письменник].
12. Perebyinis, P. (2011). *Tsyvilizatsiia derev* [Tree civilization]. Kyiv: Ukrainskyi pysmennyk (in Ukrainian)
[Перебийніс, П. (2011). *Цивілізація дерев*. Київ: Український письменник].
13. Bilodid, I. (Ed.). (1977). *Slovyk ukrainskoi movy* [Dictionary of the Ukrainian language] (Vol. 8). Kyiv: Naukova dumka (in Ukrainian)
[Білодід, І. (Ред.). (1977). *Словник української мови* (Т. 8). Київ: Наукова думка].
14. Soroka, P., & Onyskiv, M. (2005). *Svit poezii Petra Perebyinosa* [World of poetry of Peter Perebynos]. Ternopil: Dzhura (in Ukrainian)
[Сорока, П., & Ониськів, М. (2005). *Світ поезії Петра Перебийноса*. Тернопіль: Джура].

Perception of Low Income Earners on the Performance of Mortgage Institutions in Housing Finance in Lafia, Nasarawa state, Nigeria

Iliyasu Ibrahim¹, Maryam Salihu Muhammad¹, Umar Auwal¹, Daniel Raymond¹

¹ *Abubakar Tafawa Balewa University*

Tafawa Balewa Way, P. M. B. 0248, Bauchi, 740272, Nigeria

DOI: [10.22178/pos.52-3](https://doi.org/10.22178/pos.52-3)

JEL Classification: O18

Received 30.10.2019

Accepted 28.11.2019

Published online 30.11.2019

Corresponding Author:

Iliyasu Ibrahim

iliyasuibrahim1515@gmail.com

© 2019 The Authors. This article is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/) 

Abstract. The problem of housing provision by the mortgage industry which includes financing has always being a major concern to the public as a whole. This study investigated the performance of mortgage institutions in housing finance for low-income earners in Lafia metropolis, Nigeria. The objective is to assess the performance of mortgage institutions from low-income earners' perception. Data was collected through a questionnaire survey from 314 low-income earners randomly selected from the targeted population in Lafia metropolis. The data collected were subjected to descriptive statistics with mean ranking to examine the degree of agreement and the significance of the various variables. The study revealed that performance factors such as collateral, loan maturity period and loan requirement, etc. were highly ranked as the most performed area by mortgage institutions. It is recommended that government and stakeholders should reduce the high rate of interest, make mortgage loans accessible and affordable to low-income earners and also increase the funding of mortgage institutions. This study reinforces other research works on the performance of mortgage institutions in housing finance.

Keywords: Mortgage institutions; housing; finance.

INTRODUCTION

The importance of housing finance in any economy cannot be overemphasized. It drives the provision of housing which is more than shelter since it involves all the services and utilities that make a community a livable one. Housing is also one of the best indicators of a person's standard of living and his or her status in society. In spite of the crucial role housing plays like a basic need, it has remained practically inadequately in supply right through human history. An active and buoyant housing sector is an indication of a strong program of national development. It serves as a foundation for and the first step to future economic growth and social development. The housing sector plays a more critical role in a country's welfare than is always recognized as it affects not only the wellbeing of the citizens but also the performance of the other sectors in the country [5].

Mortgage financing represents the important means of housing in the world's developed economies and is also more of a challenge in de-

veloping countries. For example, the United Kingdom has the largest mortgage market in Europe which is approximately 25 % of the European market. In Mexico, the housing finance market is in a state of retrenchment, the macroeconomics environments have not been favorable to the development of the primary mortgage market [5]. The Mexican mortgage is highly segmented with a variety of mortgage programs designed for different sectors.

In Nigeria, presently the mortgage sub-sector accounts for 10 % of Nigeria's Gross Domestic Product which means that the opportunities that exist in this sector to boost the nation's economy cannot be exaggerated. The federal mortgage bank of Nigeria puts an estimated over 10 million homes as housing deficit in Nigeria; the implication of this is that with time the mortgage industry will also become large in the Nigerian capital market.

The mortgage industry in Nigeria involves few active players which are often bank subsidiaries and a collection of smaller inadequate mortgage

institutions. These institutions include semi-government agencies, mortgage banks, and building societies. Mortgage financing has often been fingered as the most difficult constraints in the Nigerian housing sector. One of the major problems has been the inadequate supply of long term funds which represents the major means of providing mortgages. Thus, the system has relied on compulsory savings into the National Housing Trust Fund (NHTF) scheme. As a result of this, the effort has been made by the regulatory authorities in Nigeria to increase the supply of long term funds for onward lending to prospective homeowners. A few of these efforts include the recent recapitalization of Primary Mortgage Institutions (PMIs) in Nigeria, the Pension and Financial Sector Reforms and the recently promoted Mortgage Backed Securities on the future of investment return in the mortgage industry. This study is set to conduct thorough research into the performance of Mortgage Institutions in Lafia, Nasarawa State, Nigeria.

Literature review

Overview of Housing. Generally, housing refers to the practice of ensuring that members in a community have a home to live in; it could be a house or some other kind of dwelling, lodging, or shelter. Authors [13], defines a house as a home when it shelters the body and comforts the soul. According to [25], a housing unit is a house, an apartment, a mobile home, a group, or a single room that is occupied (or if vacant, is intended for occupancy) as separate living quarters. However, the UN [24], suggested an explanation of a house is a structurally separate and independent place of abode such that a person or group of persons can isolate themselves from the hazards of climate such as storms and the sun was adopted. The definition, therefore, covered any type of shelter used as living quarters, such as separate houses, semi-detached houses, flats/apartments, compound houses, huts, tents, kiosks, and containers.

Needless to say, housing is one of the most important elementary necessities of humanity in every society; as it ranked next only to food in basic human needs. The housing an individual lives in is a symbol of his social standing, as it represents his accomplishments and social recognition a function of his persona and the measure that represents to a large extent, his self-esteem and social appeal. It is the measure of

all the good (or bad) things in life that will come to him and his family [4]. The production of housing and consumption has a direct impact on the socio-economic growth process in diverse ways. In one school of thought, housing is seen to advance economic growth through the expansion of the construction industry and contributes to reducing poverty by increasing the demand for low-skilled workers. Also in most developed economies, where housing equity is of much importance to households, it is found that homeownership has a significant impact on household wealth accumulation in the long run. Also, the fact remains that housing has effects definitely on the social wellbeing of the people.

Overview of Housing Finance. According to [1, 7, 20] the history of housing finance in Nigeria had been a terrible one. The sudden jump from Agro-based to Petro-Naira based economy did not help matters. The assertion that “money was not our problem but how to spend it” accredited to one of our Heads of state, is a summary of a Nation that lacked focus in the formative years. This situation together with unprecedented population growth has remained unchecked ever since. If the foundation is faulty, what can the righteous do? Housing finance was, during the colonial days was limited to the expatriate staff and few selected indigenous senior civil servants in the urban countries. The establishment of Lagos Executive Development Board in 1928; Nigeria Building Society in 1956; formation of State Housing Corporations between 1956 and 1960; National Council of Housing 1971 and, Federal Mortgage Bank of Nigeria 1977 with takeoff capital of N20 million which was later increased to N150 million in 1979, are very familiar developments in our history.

The World Bank assistance was obtained in 1979. This led to housing projects in eight states of Nigeria with Bauchi State having a share of N24.6 million and Imo State, N63.8 million. The 1980–1985 fourth National Development Programs also proposed a budget of N1.9 billion for housing.

During this period N600 million was spent on housing construction. The failure of these incremental housing production programs and the ever-increasing housing needs led to the promulgation of the National Housing Policy of 1991.

Housing Finance System in Nigeria. The present structure of housing finance in Nigeria can be classified into the following. Informal sector

(Esusu i.e. Traditional Co-operative System, Credit Co-operatives and family savings); Formal Sector (Non-specialized Institutions and Specialized Housing Finance Institutions). Others (Communities, Associations and Non-Governmental Associations).

The informal sectors of housing funding in Nigeria are traditional Esusu, credit co-operatives, family sources, and individual savings. This sector is usually local and informal in the organization based on trust, love, and friendship. The operation of this sector is difficult to quantify as they operate on the transfer of cash and kind. These include donations of land, building materials, cash assistance or sometimes any of these could be in the form of a loan. The informal sector operation also involves direct labor assistance. It is interesting to note that this sector constitutes a larger proportion of housing providers in Nigeria.

The operation of the formal sector can be classified into Non-specialized Housing Funding Institutions and the Specialized Housing Funding Institutions. Non-Specialized Housing Funding Institutions include the Employees Housing Schemes, Commercial, Merchant Banks and Insurance Companies.

The need to encourage employers of labor to use part of their profit to provide housing for their workers led to the promulgation of the 1979 "Employees Housing Scheme (Special Provision) Decree". The decree requires among others, large employers of labor specifically those who either have not less than 500 persons in their employment in any state of the federation or may be designated as such by the Federal Commissioner (now a minister) with the approval by the Federal Executive Council to establish a housing scheme for their employee. The decree further states that not less than three-quarters of the total accommodation made available in every such scheme shall be for employees who are not executive or senior staff. This is perhaps one of the major housing policy instruments aimed at facilitating the participation of corporate bodies in housing delivery. It has achieved very little. This is partly due to the weak machinery for monitoring which is in a division in the Ministry of Labour [4]. The National Housing Fund (NHF) Decree was promulgated in 1992 aimed at increasing the financial pool that could be used for housing. Nigerians earning from N3000 per annum

and above are expected to contribute 2.5 % of their income into NHF.

Before the National Housing Fund Decree, commercial and merchant banks always held a very significant proportion of the mortgage assets within the formal lending sector [21]. Within combined total assets of about N86, 660 million as of December 1989, the commercial and merchant banks held a wider asset base than any other institutional group within the financial sector during this period. Their combined loans and advances portfolio totaled N27.7 million. About 13 % were for real estate. Though with the high-interest rate in the financial market, commercial and merchant banks are now reluctant to finance housing projects except where the houses are to be placed in the market for outright purchase, though this is not good enough for the low-income earners. The banks are operating with short-term deposits whereas housing finance can only thrive in a long term funding environment.

Before the promulgation of the National Housing Fund Decree, insurance companies were obliged to invest not less than 25 % of their life funds in real estate. This was not satisfactorily complied with by these companies because there are many other alternative investments into which they can inject policyholders' funds and achieve better investment returns.

Specialized housing funding institutions in Nigeria include the following: The Federal Mortgage Bank of Nigeria, Primary Mortgage Institutions, Housing Corporations, and Urban Development Bank.

The Federal Mortgage Bank of Nigeria (FMBN) was established in 1977, with the inheritance of the assets and liabilities of the Nigerian Building Society (NBS), which was dissolved, in the same year. The FMBN was created essentially to serve as a wholesale and apex housing finance institution in Nigeria under Decree 7 of 1977. Other institutions created with the responsibilities to serve as housing finance were created through Decree 53 of 1989. They include the Primary Mortgage Institutions such as Building Societies, Housing Associations, and Credit Unions. Among the major responsibilities of the FMBN are the provision of long-term credit facilities to mortgage institutions in the country; encouragement and promotion of development of mortgage institutions at state and national levels supervision and control of the activities of mortgage institutions, mobilization of savings particularly

through the National Housing Fund, promotion of investment in the manufacturing of building materials and promotion of research on construction and mortgage finance.

The role of the FMBN has also been expanded to back the mortgage finance market with the capital market and develop the viable secondary mortgage market and to mobilize foreign funds into the housing finance sub-sector. The shortcomings of the FMBN operation must have led to the re-examination of the National Housing Policy and the establishment of the National Housing Fund; the two policy instruments of government aimed at enhancing housing delivery in Nigeria. The National Housing Policy also led to the establishment of Primary Mortgage Institutions (PMI) in Nigeria. Unfortunately within less than five years of the taking off of PMI most of their operations were confronted with problems that resulted in the situation whereby most of the PMI's have their offices closed.

One of the major achievements of the National Housing Policy is its institutional reform which resulted in the establishment of a two-tier formal housing finance system following the promulgation of the Mortgage Institution Decree no. 53 of 1989. Under this arrangement, the FMBN was restricted as the country apex mortgage institution with a supervisory role over a network of PMI. The PMI's are to serve as secondary housing finance institutions. Under the arrangement, the FMBN ceases operation as a retail housing finance institution. This role is to be performed by the PMI's. The role of FMBN henceforth remains as the apex and regulatory body. To perform these functions the FMBN was re-organized into three divisions as follows: The National Housing Fund Division charged with the responsibility for the arrangement of the National Housing Fund. The Regulatory and Inspectorate Division charged with the responsibility of monitoring and regulating housing finance sector operations and Corporate Service Division to provide administrative, accounting and management information services to the core divisions.

The basic functions of the PMI's as stated in the official guidelines of the FMBN are as follows, to ensure equitable distribution of mortgage lending activities all over the country, to operate efficient and effective mortgage institutions, to dictate the level and pace of growth in industry and minimize avoidable fraudulent losses of PMIs and to ensure timely and adequate loan performance

to create opportunity for structure expansion in the provision of housing finance.

Based on the report released by the Central Bank, out of about 350 PMIs licensed only 81 are presently declared healthy. To enhance deposit mobilization many PMIs developed attractive products in addition to the National Housing Fund such as social loan, economic loan, commercial loan, mortgage administration deposited institutional deposits, children savings among others.

The first Housing Corporation in Nigeria was the Western Nigeria Housing Corporation established in 1959 after which other State Housing Corporations including the Federal Housing Authority were modeled. They are all established to make available to Nigerians long term credits for housing development. Having realized this shortcoming in their operations many state governments have established property finance agencies, such as Lagos Building and Investment Company (LBIC) to serve the Lagos State Development and Property Corporation (LSDPC) and Ogun State Property Investment Corporation (OPIC) to service the Ogun State Housing Corporation. Virtually all states of the federation have this type of configuration established to promote smooth funding of the housing sector, with operations more favorable to government housing development.

The Urban Development Bank of Nigerian (UDBN) Plc, was established by Decree No 51 of 1992 to foster the rapid development of urban infrastructure throughout the federation through the provision of finance and banking services [27]. It is in the context of infrastructure that the issue of housing finance became part of the bank responsibilities. UDBN cannot be regarded as a bank like any of the regular commercial and merchant banks but a development institution with banking functions.

Housing and Mortgage Finance. The use of either housing loans or mortgage system to acquire dwelling places by Nigerians is of interest because of the level of income and the relatively small size of the mortgage market compared to the size of the financial market. The housing and mortgage finance market should represent a sizeable proportion of the domestic financial market because of the relatively long term structure of mortgage financing. Authors [26], comparing several countries grouped alongside development strata shows that stronger legal rights for both borrowers and lenders, macroeconomic

conditions and deeper credit information systems are strong factors that can help in deepening the mortgage market in any country. The more the information available and the easier it is to enforce collateral rights (ability to possess), the bigger the market tends to be in all countries, the size of the country notwithstanding. The Nigerian market is especially difficult given the macroeconomic volatility that makes policies to become unstable and therefore unreliable in the long term.

The impact of a well-developed mortgage market in the financial environment can be quantified from the crowding-in effect of the other investments that could lead to exports in Nigeria. Adopting an instrument distributed to nearly all the participants in the mortgage and construction industry, author [17], admits that the market is far from being developed and PMIs operations are bundled. Repayment problems occur where macroeconomic changes affect the income of mortgagors who become unable to meet their financial obligations. Another critical problem of mortgage and housing finance in Nigeria remains the Land Use Decree 1978 which has made the acquisition of title on land a near impossibility. Other problems are inflation, land acquisitions and documentation, the insufficient capital base for the PMIs, financial constraints in the market, high cost of building material and inadequate infrastructure are others.

Housing as an investment and consumer goods constantly yield positive values. Investment in own housing is an important part of personal financial planning which enables the individual to build a hedge against inflation and erosion of currency values. Also, housing has been noted to compel people to save in Nigeria and is not known to affect the BOP adversely [10]. The use of cheap local building materials, for example, the Compressed Stabilized Laterite Bricks (CSLB) have been advocated, but this would need constant encouragement and enlightenment for it to become successful and acceptable [6]. The impact of mortgage finance can be important in poverty reduction, growth and general economic development of the country, especially during construction.

The mortgage sub-sector of the financial system developed more rapidly during the era of universal banking between 2000 and 2010 and was more pronounced after the banking recapitalizations of 2004–2006. The sector enabled the

banks to expand their operations with the establishment of PMIs or take-over of insolvent institutions. Thus, the PMIs were strengthened and were able to lend more for mortgage purposes from 2006 since mortgage loans increased from ₦2.1 billion to ₦7.56 billion and on to ₦40.76 billion in 2007. However, many of these PMIs are frustrated with the management of the NHF and its inability to function as envisaged. Many of the more viable ones especially quoted PMIs have accessed other sources of long term funding externally to provide mortgage loans to Nigerians including partnering with construction firms, Examples are (a) Abbey Building Society plc. (with IFC backed Mortgage Facility Refinance Company and Union Homes plc. (with Swaffer pty of South Africa). One noticeable feature in the housing market is the insurance firms who rather than make their funds available through the FMBN to NHF preferred to directly involved in the construction and mortgage business by lending directly and constructing properties for sale or let.

Challenges of Mortgage Institutions in Housing Finance. Many constraints are limiting the availability of housing finance in Nigeria. Some of these constraints were identified by [9], as unstable macroeconomic conditions, a weak legal framework for property rights, lack of mortgage market infrastructure, and unavailability of funds for long-term finance to promote financial intermediation.

From other sources, including Tiwari and Moriyumi (2003), poor access to finance has been widely identified as the major impediment to having affordable housing in Nigeria. Indeed, the problem of access to finance is recognized as one of the major constraints of housing finance in most emerging economies (Chiquier & Lea, 2009).

In Nigeria, author [18] using survey analysis and secondary data highlighted that the National Housing Fund policy, land use act, structure of primary mortgage institutions, high-interest rates were some constraints to mortgage financing in Nigeria. Researchers [19], examined the problems of financing real estate development in Nigeria through the administration of questionnaires and simple descriptive analysis. The study revealed that high-interest rates and several other requirements for loan application bedeviled the financing of real properties in Nigeria. The study, therefore, recommended, among others, that the Nigerian Government should en-

deavor to solve economic problems, such as inflation, to minimize the problems that plague the financing of real estate development. Authors [3], evaluated the performance of the National Housing Fund Scheme in terms of housing delivery in Nigeria. The study adopted secondary data and employed the use of percentiles and t-test as well as Pearson Product Moment of Correlation for analysis. The result indicated that the Primary Mortgage Institutions (PMIs) were not adequate in number and that there was a wide difference between the amounts the mortgagors applied for and the amounts approved.

According to [5], in their work *The Assessment of the Contribution of Primary Mortgage Institutions to Housing Finance in Nigeria*. Their work identified two factors that contributed to the vague performance record of Federal Mortgage Bank of Nigeria as lack of information to most savings contributors who are willing prospective borrowers and rigid conditions stipulated by Federal Mortgage Bank of Nigeria for obtaining National Housing Fund loan.

Authors [5], further identified that prolonged problems which has constrained adequate and efficient credit delivery to the housing sector as, low-interest rate on National Housing Fund, low level of participation in the National Housing Fund scheme, macroeconomics environment, non-vibrancy of some PMIs, cumbersome legal regulatory framework for land acquisition, the structure of bank deposit liabilities, low capitalization, inadequate mobilization of funds through savings deposits, distractions and failure to confine activities to savings mobilization and mortgage lending and loan defaults.

Methodology

The research design for this study is a quantitative method, and a field survey was adopted where the questionnaire was used as an instrument for data collection because it provides greater degree responses when administered properly. The population of the study includes all the 16 ministries under the Nasarawa state government, the sample frame of the study is 9,000 and the sample size was determined using table of determining sample size as 368. The study adopted a stratified sampling technique where all the sixteen (16) ministries were stratified into four (4) different strata and each stratum consist of four (4) ministries. From each of the strata,

twenty-three (23) respondents were chosen from each ministry making a total of 92 respondents from each stratum using proportionate random sampling. The questionnaires were administered to 360 respondents where 314 were retrieved.

The data collected were analyzed using SPSS version 21. The demographic information of the respondents, Performance of Mortgage Institutions in Housing Finance were analyzed using descriptive statistics, also ANOVA and Post Hoc Test were conducted to see if there are significant differences between permanent, casual, contract and temporary employees' perception on the performance of mortgage institutions in the study area. The reliability test was employed in the study to measure the internal consistency of the instrument using Cronbach's alpha, where values above 0.7 are considered acceptable [14].

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Respondents filled information relating to their background that included gender, age, marital status, level of education, term of employment and their respective ministries (Table 1).

Table 1 – Demographic Information of the Respondents

Variables	Options	Frequency	Percentage
Gender	Male	238	75.8
	Female	76	24.2
Age	18-3	62	19.7
	31-40	189	60.2
	41-50	51	16.2
	51-60	12	3.8
Marital Status	Single	56	17.8
	Married	234	74.5
	Divorced	21	6.7
	Separated	1	0.3
	Widow	2	0.6
Level of Education	FSLC	41	13.1
	SSCE	75	23.9
	Diploma	198	63.1
Term of Employment	Temporary	26	8.3
	Permanent	264	84.1
	Contract	5	1.6
	Casual	19	6.1

Table 1 shows that the majority of the respondents are male representing 75.8 % while females represented 24.2 %. This means that male respondents have dominated the junior staff

workforce of various ministries in Nasarawa State.

The table revealed that age 31–40 has the highest percentage of 60.2 % followed by age 18–30 with 19.7 %, then age 41–50 with 16.2 % and then age 51–60 with 3.8 %. This indicates that age 31–40 dominated the junior staff workforce of Nasarawa state and 51-60 is the least age in the junior staff workforce of the state. At age 31–40 people tend to be eager in their ambition of getting the house as observed from the information in the field survey.

The information obtained shows that 74.5 % of the respondents are married while 17.8 % of them are single, those that are divorced represent 6.7 % followed by those that are a widow with 0.6 % and those that are separated represent 0.3 %. Those that are married have the highest percentage while the widow carried the least percentage. Married people dominated the junior staff cadre of Nasarawa State who is mostly concern about how to own houses rather than being tenants as gotten from the field survey.

The level of education determines the level of knowledge and exposure to mortgage issues thus considered important. As indicated by the table Diploma holders has the highest percentage of 63.1 % followed by Senior School Certificate holders with 23.9 % and First School Leaving Certificate holders (FSLC) with 13.1%. Diploma holders dominated the Nasarawa State workforce of junior staff having carried the highest percentage and first school leavers have the least percentage.

The results show that those on permanent appointments have the highest percentage of 84.1 % followed by those on a temporary appointment with 8.3 % than those on casual with 6.1% and then those on contract with 1.6 %. Those on permanent appointments dominated the junior staff workforce with the highest percentage while those on casual carried the least percentage. The respondents who are on permanent appointment dominated the junior staff cadre and are those that normally contribute to NHF as obtained from the field survey.

The Table 2 below revealed that one of the areas that mortgage institutions performed well is in using low-income earners' salaries as collateral. When the respondents were asked whether mortgage institutions use their salary as collat-

eral, the majority of them agreed with the statement. The statement is ranked first in Table 2 with a mean of 4.2994 and a relative important index of 0.8599.

Table 2– Performance of mortgage institutions

Statement	Mean	RII	Ranking
Mortgage Institutions use low income earners' salary as collateral.	4.2994	0.8599	1st
Mortgage loan to low income earners have long maturity period.	3.9904	0.7981	2nd
Mortgage Institutions' requirements for mortgage loans favor the low income earners.	2.9873	0.5975	3rd
Mortgage loan is affordable to low income earners.	2.9395	0.5879	4th
Mortgage loans by Mortgage Institutions are accessible to the low income earners.	2.7229	0.5446	5th
Mortgage Institutions provide the needed loan for low income earners to own houses.	2.7134	0.5427	6th
Mortgage Institutions provide the needed information to savings contributors.	2.1369	0.4274	7th
Conditions stipulated by FMB for obtaining NHF loan are not rigid.	1.6051	0.3210	8th
The rate of interest charged by Mortgage Institutions is low.	1.5191	0.3038	9th

Responses from the respondents showed that the second-best area of performance by the mortgage institutions is on the maturity period of mortgage loans which is ranked second in the table with a mean of 3.9904 and an RII of 0.7981.

Another area that the responses indicated the performance of mortgage institutions is on the requirements of mortgage loans by mortgage institutions favoring the low-income earners which were ranked third in the table with a mean of 2.9873 and an R^2 of 0.5975.

On the issue of loan affordability by low-income earners responses from the respondents indicated that mortgage loan is fairly affordable to them and is ranked fourth in the table with a mean of 2.9395 and R^2 of 0.5879.

On whether a mortgage loan is accessible to low-income earners the responses showed that the loan is not easily accessible to them and is ranked fifth in the table with a mean of 2.7229 and R^2 of 0.5446.

The table showed that mortgage institutions performed well in terms of loan provided to the low-income earners to own houses. The statement was ranked sixth in the table with a mean of 2.7134 and R^2 of 0.5427.

Also, mortgage institutions failed to perform well in the area of providing the needed information to the low-income earners as the statement was ranked seventh in the table with a mean of 2.1369 and R^2 of 0.4274.

Another area that mortgage institutions performed least is on the conditions stipulated by Federal Mortgage Bank for obtaining National Housing Fund loans which are rigid as revealed by the responses obtained from the respondents and are ranked eighth in the table with a mean of 1.6051 and R^2 of 0.3210.

On interest rate responses obtained from the respondents showed that mortgage institutions performed worst in this regard. The respondents indicated that the rate of interest is high and it was ranked ninth in Table 3 with a mean of 1.5191 and R^2 of 0.3038.

Table 3 – Performance ANOVA

	Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
Between Groups	4.090	3	1.363	2.323	.075
Within Groups	181.943	310	.587		
Total	186.033	313			

The table above shows the ANOVA result of performance. The result shows an F value of 2.323 which is not significant at a 95 percent confidence interval as indicated by 0.075 p-values above 0.05. This indicated that there are no statistically significant differences among employees in their perception of the performance of mortgage institutions in housing finance. However, the result is marginally significant as the p-value is slightly above 0.05 and is significant at a 90 percent confidence interval. Authors [14] observed that if there is a marginally significant difference, there might be significant pairwise ad

hoc differences and therefore recommended post hoc test to establish such. To establish if such differences exist, a post hoc test was carried out and presented in Table 4 below.

Table 4 – Post Hoc Test of Performance

(I) Term of Employment	(J) Term of Employment	Mean Difference (I-J)	Std. Error	Sig.
Temporary	Permanent	.39190*	.15747	.013
	Contract	.35983	.37411	.337
	Casual	.19726	.23122	.394
Permanent	Temporary	-.39190*	.15747	.013
	Contract	-.03207	.34584	.926
	Casual	-.19464	.18197	.286
Contract	Temporary	-.35983	.37411	.337
	Permanent	.03207	.34584	.926
	Casual	-.16257	.38506	.673
Casual	Temporary	-.19726	.23122	.394
	Permanent	.19464	.18197	.286
	Contract	.16257	.38506	.673

The post hoc test was carried out and the result showed that there is a significant difference in opinions as relating to the performance of mortgage institutions between those on temporary appointments and those on permanent appointments as indicated by a mean difference of 0.39190 which is statistically significant as shown by 0.013 p-values which are below 0.05 level. The post hoc test also revealed that there is no significant difference in opinion between those on temporary appointments and those on contract as indicated by a mean difference of 0.35983 which is not statistically significant as shown by 0.337 p-values which are above 0.05 level. The result also showed that there is no significant difference in opinion between those on temporary appointments and those on casual appointments as indicated by a mean difference of 0.19726 which is not statistically significant as shown by 0.394 p-values which are above 0.05 level.

The post hoc test carried out indicated that there is no statistically significant difference on the perception of those on permanent appointments and those on contract appointments as regard to the performance of mortgage institutions as indicated by a mean difference of -0.3207 which is not statistically significant as shown by 0.926 p-values which is above 0.05 significant level. The result also revealed that no significant difference in opinion by those on permanent appointments

and those on casual as indicated by a mean difference of -0.1964 which is not statistically significant as shown by 0.286 p-values which is above 0.05 significant level.

The analysis carried out also indicated that there is no significant difference in perception on the performance of mortgage institutions by those on contract appointments and those on casual appointments as indicated by a mean difference of -0.1627 which is not statistically significant as shown by 0.673 p-values which are above 0.05 significant level.

From the foregoing, it can be concluded that there is a significant difference between those on temporary appointments and those on permanent appointments on their perception of the performance of mortgage institutions. However, post hoc analysis revealed that there is no pairwise statistical difference between those on temporary appointments, those on contract appointments and those on casual appointments on the performance of mortgage institutions.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATION

The findings from the survey carried out indicated that mortgage institutions performed well in the area of using low-income earners salary as collateral but failed in providing loan to low-income earners to own houses, the result also shows that mortgage loan is partially accessible to the low-income class and that the rate of interest charged by the mortgage institutions is high.

Because of the findings made and conclusions drawn from the study, the following recommendations are provided by the researcher to help enhance and sustain the mortgage industry and also provide recommendations to help in the improvement of Housing Finance options.

REFERENCES

1. Abiodun, A. (1999). *Housing finance under National Housing Fund*. An appraisal paper presented at the General Meeting of the Nigeria Institute of Town Planning.
2. Adedeji, Y. M. D., & Abiodun O. O. (2012). *An Evaluation of Accessibility of Low-Income Earners to Housing Finance in Nigeria*. *European Scientific Journal*, 8(12), 80–95.
3. Adedokun, O. A., Akinradewo, F. O., Adegoke, J. O., & Abiola-Falemu, J. O. (2011). *Evaluation of the Performance of National Housing Fund Scheme towards Housing Delivery in Nigeria*. *Journal of Emerging Trends in Economic and Management Science*, 2(6), 467-471.
4. Agbola, T. (1998). *The housing of Nigerians: a review of policy development and implementation in the housing sector*. Ibadan: Development Policy Centre.

The mortgage institutions should adopt more strategies to make their products more known to the market. This could be done by training more officers to reach out to the general public, through flyers and personally explaining to potential clients to get to know the benefits and opportunities they stand to gain by adopting mortgage loans as a strategy to finance their housing projects. Information is very vital to the development of any institution. The low-income class should be well informed about the loan products available to them so that they can make decisions on them. The mortgage institutions should involve in campaign awareness from place to place, use both electronic and print media and also in social media enlightening the low-income group on what they stand to get if they participated fully in the NHF scheme.

The research also recommends a joint talk by the government and the mortgage institutions to lower the interest rate, to reduce the burden that clients complain about mortgage loans. This, in turn, will bring in more clients on board as the majority of people were hindered by the interest rate. The government and all stakeholders in mortgage industries should come together and review the current rate of interest on mortgage loans this will enable the low-income class to obtain the loan at an affordable rate and be able to build their houses. Also, the research recommends that the loan should be made accessible to the low-income class who wishes to access it to finance the housing project.

The research also recommends that mortgage institutions should make mortgage loan requirements very flexible so that low-income earners would not find it difficult in their effort to access the loan product available.

5. Akinjare, V., Adetiloye, K., Akhanolu, I., & Tochukwu, O. (2016). *The Assessment of the Contribution of Primary Mortgage Institutions to Housing Finance in Nigeria: A Case Study of Union Homes Savings and Loans PLC*. *Asian Journal of Information Technology*, 15(13), 2094–2100.
6. Alagbe, O. A. (2011). *Enhancing Sustainable Housing Development in Nigeria Using Compressed Stabilized Laterite Bricks*. *Journal of Sustainable Development and Environmental Protection*, 1(3), 51–59.
7. Arilesere, D. (1997). *Housing Finance in Nigeria*. A paper presented during Nigerian Institute of Building organised workshop on Affordable Housing, Lagos.
8. Bichi, K. M. (2000). *The Role of Federal Mortgage Bank of Nigeria in Financing and Procurement of Housing Infrastructure in Nigeria*. Workshop paper organized by the Nigeria Institute of Quantity Surveyors, Abuja. CBN, (1990). *Economic and Financial Review*. CBN, Lagos.
9. Buckley, R., & Kalarickal J. (2013). *Shelter strategies for the urban poor idiosyncratic and successful, but hardly mysterious*. Washington: World Bank.
10. Chatterjee, L. (1982). *Housing in Indonesia*. Amsterdam: Free University.
11. Chiquier, L. & Lea, M. (2009). *Housing finance policy in emerging markets*. Washington: World Bank Publications.
12. Denise, D. & Wheaton, C. (1992). *The Markets for Real Estate and Space: A Conceptual Framework*, *Journal of the American Real Estate and Urban Economics Association*, 20(1), 181–197.
13. Durlauf, S., & Blume, E. (Eds.). (2018). *New Palgrave Dictionary of Economics* (2nd ed.). London: Palgrave Macmillan.
14. George, D., & Mallery, P. (2006). *SPSS for Windows Step by Step: A Simple Guide and Reference, 13.0 update* (6th ed.). Boston: Pearson.
15. Lea, M. J., Bernstein, S. (1996). *The role of the primary mortgage market in the development of a successful secondary mortgage market*. Washington: Inter-American Development Bank.
16. Mailafia, O. (2007). *The place and prospects of mortgage financing in the economic and financial systems reforms in Nigeria*. A paper presented at year 2007 Board/Staff Retreat. Federal Mortgage Bank Nigeria, Jos, March 23–24, 2007.
17. Nubi, T. O. (2002). *Financing Low Income Housing in Nigeria Cities: – Need for Paradigm Shift*. In *Proceeding, National Conference on Cities in Nigeria, 9–11 October 2002* (p. 135–138.). Ile-Ife: Obafemi Awolowo University. Retrieved from <http://196.45.48.50/opendocnew.php?docname=27920&doctype=doc&doctitle=%22Demystifying-the-Affordable-Housing-Debacle-in-a-Transiting-Economy%22>
18. Oduwaye, L. (2008). *Challenges of Housing Finance by Primary Mortgage Institutions in Lagos Nigeria*. Retrieved from [https://www.nar.realtor/IRPF.nsf/ca2dae5fa466338d862567e6004ad5ff/cc4930956d3bcf01862577fa0072bdc8/\\$FILE/Nigeria%20Desktop.pdf](https://www.nar.realtor/IRPF.nsf/ca2dae5fa466338d862567e6004ad5ff/cc4930956d3bcf01862577fa0072bdc8/$FILE/Nigeria%20Desktop.pdf)
19. Ogedengbe, P. S., & Adesopo, A. A. (2003). *Problems of Financing Real Estate Development in Nigeria*. *Journal of Human Ecology*, 14(6), 425–431. doi: 10.1080/09709274.2003.11905648
20. Okupe, L. (2000). *The Role of Private Sector in housing Delivery in Nigeria*. Retrieved from <http://catdir.loc.gov/catdir/toc/fy038/2003391121.html>
21. Onabule, D. (1990). *Housing Delivery in Nigeria National Workshop on Housing Delivery in Nigeria*. Abuja.
22. Oni, S. A. (2005). *Mortgage Institutions and Financing in Nigeria: Performance, Constraints and Prospects*. *Central Bank of Nigeria Economic and Financial Review*, 43(4), 77–82.
23. Tiwari, P., & Moriizumi, Y. (2003). *Efficiency in housing finance: a comparative study of mortgage instruments in Japan*. *European Journal of Housing Policy*, 3(3), 267–288. doi: 10.1080/14616710310001630721

24. United Nations. (1984). *Promotion of non-conventional approaches to housing finance for low-income groups*. Nairobi: United Nation Centre for Human Settlements.
25. US Census Bureau. (2010). *2010 US Census United States*. Washington: Census Bureau. Retrieved from <https://factfinder.census.gov/faces/nav/jsf/pages/index.xhtml>
26. Warnock, V. C., & Warnock, F. E. (2008). Markets and housing finance. *Journal of Housing Economics*, 17(3), 239–251. doi: 10.1016/j.jhe.2008.03.001
27. Zubairu, M. (1997). *Housing Development in Nigeria: The Federal Housing Authority Experience*. Workshop on Financing and Procurement of Housing and Infrastructure, The Nigerian Institute of Quantity Surveyors. Lagos.

Infrastructure and Linkage Challenges in the Execution of Agricultural Programmes in Cross River State, Nigeria

Eno Joseph Mbang ¹, Michael Chukwunke Madukwe ¹, Irenonsen Oyaimare Uddin ¹

¹ *University of Nigeria, Nsukka*

Nsukka Road, 410001, Nsukka, Enugu State, Nigeria

DOI: [10.22178/pos.52-4](https://doi.org/10.22178/pos.52-4)

LCC Subject Category: [S1-\(972\)](#)

Received 28.10.2019

Accepted 25.11.2019

Published online 30.11.2019

Corresponding Author:

[Irenonsen Oyaimare Uddin](#)

© 2019 The Authors. This article is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License](#)



Abstract. The study ascertained the infrastructure and linkage challenges in the execution of agricultural programs in Cross River State, Nigeria. The proportionate sampling technique was used to select one hundred and thirteen (113) staff. Percentage, mean statistic and standard deviation were used in the analysis and presentation of data. Results showed that among all infrastructures in the ministry, building(s) for offices was available and functional at 71.8 % and 62.7 % respectively. The ministry had inadequate equipment to execute agricultural programs (M=2.54), weak linkage with universities (M=1.31) and research institutes (M=1.37) and very poor feedback mechanisms between research institutes and the state ministry (M=1.98). The study recommends that the ministry of agriculture should intensify its linkage with other agencies and research institutes through inter-agency collaboration, mobility of linkage experts and proper training of staff on linkage matters. Needed equipment and facilities should be purchased for various departments by the state government to improve productivity.

Keywords: agricultural infrastructure; agricultural programmes; linkage challenges.

INTRODUCTION

The Cross River State Ministry of agriculture was established primarily to administer agricultural policies, services, pricing, support programs and schemes, drought management and business strategy for its products as well as to enhance the quality of life of the people [7]. Others include; prioritizing agricultural research, food inspection, export and import policymaking, and distribution of food in rural and urban areas of the country during crisis periods like drought, flood, erosion or natural calamity [12].

To achieve the ministry's set objectives, successive administrations developed agricultural programs and projects such as; Cross River Commercial Agriculture Credit Scheme, Cross Rivers State Agricultural and Rural Empowerment Scheme, Oil palm production project and the pineapple production project under the Cross River Agricultural Development Programme, Root and Tuber Expansion Programme, Fadama development program, Songhai Cross River Ini-

tative, Cross River Commercial Agriculture Development Programme. A huge success was recorded in program implementation, food security strategy improved productivity, technological innovations, etc. as a result of proper administration. There were effective follow-up and evaluation of extension units in the ministry, farmers were properly assisted by the state government, donor agencies and private organizations to ensure a better standard of living and food security for the populace through agriculture. However, most of these programs experienced persistent failure and untimed implementation, revealing the basic weakness of these agricultural policies. The inability of successive administrations to solve these brought setbacks in agricultural development and program implementation. The failures came in different measures of which poor agricultural infrastructure development and linkage formation among agricultural stakeholders in the state were key.

Adequate infrastructure and strong linkage formation are major determinants of agricultural

growth and productivity. In addition to other factors such as human capital, credit markets, extension services, and technological research, the presence of reliable infrastructure increases both output per capita and output per unit of land [2]. It is, therefore, a key contributor to the productivity, mainly by reducing transaction costs in input and output markets, as well as better integrating markets within sub-regions. No doubt that there is a well-established relationship between infrastructure and agricultural productivity. Given the criticality of financing constraints, it is also of necessity that there be a clear understanding of an emerging source of funding for infrastructure in the agricultural sector.

According to [19], two main reasons have been advanced for the poor responsiveness of private investments in African agriculture. The first is poor agriculture infrastructure (roads, research, extension, level of farmer awareness, access to agricultural services, etc.). Poor infrastructure is a major reason for the high costs of doing business and a factor in the lack of competitiveness. The second factor is weak institutions (including law and order, land management) in this respect [11], have argued that getting prices does matter, but so does getting institutions right. The argument here is that markets cannot work if coordination is weak and institutions are missing. Addressing these two constraints, namely weak infrastructure and poor linkage formation between institutions, clearly requires the active role of the government and all stakeholders in the agriculture sector.

In light of all the aforementioned, there is a need to critically x-ray these challenges facing Cross River State Ministry of Agriculture of Nigeria, proffer possible solutions to these challenges to pave way for a better future in the ministry. The purpose of the study was to ascertain the infrastructure and linkage challenges in the execution of agricultural programs in Cross River State, Nigeria. Specifically, the study sought to:

- examine infrastructure challenges in the administration of the state ministry of agriculture;
- examine the challenges of linkage formation in the execution of agricultural programs of the ministry;
- identify strategies for addressing these challenges.

METHODOLOGY

The population of the study constituted all the staff (administrative and technical) within the eleven (11) departments of the ministry of agriculture in Cross River State, Nigeria. The eleven departments have a total of 568 staff as at July, 2014. To properly represent staff in each department, a proportionate sampling technique was used in selecting respondents; twenty percent of the total number of staff in each department was selected as shown in Table 1 giving a total sample size of one hundred and thirteen (113) respondents.

Table 1 – Population and sampling procedure

No	Departments in the state ministry of agriculture	Population of staff*	Sample (20% of staff)
1	Livestock	60	12
2	Veterinary	95	19
3	Produce Services	103	21
4	Fisheries	32	6
5	Agricultural Finances	14	3
6	Agricultural Services	92	18
7	CARES	14	3
8	Administration	62	12
9	Finance and Supplies	32	6
10	Planning, Research and Statistics	11	2
11	Agricultural Development Programme	53	11
	Total	568	113

Notes: *Staff strength as at July, 2014

Data were collected using a questionnaire, comprising closed and open-ended questions. To ascertain infrastructural challenges in the ministry, questions on the availability and functionality of some infrastructure (building(s) for offices, internet services, computers and accessories, tractors, project vehicles, etc.) in the ministry were raised. Furthermore, respondents were asked to indicate their rating on the maintenance of equipment and facilities, office space, power supply, etc. on a four-point Likert-type scale of good (3), fair (2), poor (1), and very poor (0). The values were summed up to get 6, which was divided by 4 to obtain a mean score value of 1.5. Variables with mean values of 1.5 and above were regarded as infrastructure factors affecting

the state ministry of agriculture, while those with mean values less than 1.5 were not regarded as infrastructure factors affecting the state ministry of agriculture.

Objective 2 ascertained linkage formation challenges in the execution of the agricultural program of the ministry. Respondents were asked to tick against each stakeholder the ministry had linkage with and the strength of linkage was rated on a four-point Likert-type scale of very weak (0), weak (1), strong (2) and very strong (3). Values were summed up to get 6, divided by 4 to obtain the mean score of 1.5. Stakeholders with mean values of 1.5 and above were considered as having linkage with the ministry, while those with mean values of less than 1.5 were not regarded thus.

Furthermore, a four-point Likert-type scale of good (3), fair (2) poor (1) and very poor (0) was used to ascertain how factors namely; policy issues between the state ministry of agriculture and other agencies, ICT skills of staff of the ministry, organizational rigidity and others pose challenges to linkage in the ministry. The values were summed up to get 6, which was divided by 4 to obtain a mean score value of 1.5. Variables with mean values of 1.5 and above were regarded as linkage factors affecting the ministry, while those with mean values less than 1.5 were not regarded thus.

Respondents were requested to indicate strategies to address the challenges faced by the ministry (objective 3) in the areas of infrastructure and linkage. Percentage, mean statistic and standard deviation were used in the analysis and presentation of data.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Infrastructural challenges in the ministry

Availability and functionality of infrastructure in the ministry. Results in Table 2 show that among all infrastructures in the ministry, building(s) for offices was available and functional at 71.8% and 62.7% respectively. From the interaction, most of the buildings need renovation and proper maintenance to sustain them (E. Effiwatt, personal communication, May 20, 2014). Furthermore, the ministry needed basic ICT gadgets such as projectors, cameras, and internet access. ICTs enhance easy communication between staff and farmers for enhanced productivity [26]. Insuffi-

cient or unavailability of ICT facilities reduces staff functionality and agricultural productivity [26]. Author [19] noted that poor agricultural infrastructure hinders access to agricultural services, mostly in the rural populace where development is aimed to boost agricultural productivity [2]. It is axiomatic that poor conditions of work, low salaries or official rewards are key problems that have eroded the professionalism of the Nigerian public service [27].

Table 2 – Percentage distribution on the availability and functionality of infrastructure in the ministry

Infrastructure	Available (%)**	Functional (%)**
Building(s) for offices	71.8*	62.7*
Chairs and tables	66.4*	49.1
Power generating sets	61.8*	49.1
Printers	58.2*	48.2
Computer and its accessories	56.4*	40.0
Project vehicles	54.5*	47.3
Tractors	42.7	28.2
Internet services	40.0	9.1
Photocopiers	37.3	33.6
Television set	36.4	34.5
Storage facilities	30.9	21.8
Projectors	29.1	22.7
Deep freezers / Refrigerator	27.3	14.5
Cameras	19.1	10.9
Satellite connections	14.5	8.2
Video players	10.0	10.0

Notes: *Available and functional infrastructure; **Multiple response

Perceived level of infrastructure challenges in the ministry of agriculture. The ministry had inadequate equipment to execute agricultural programs (M=2.54). Agricultural programs are developmental and geared towards increased productivity, poverty reduction, and income generation for rural farmers [6]. When equipment needed by the ministry for executing programs are insufficient, limited or unavailable, there is bound to be a setback in the implementation of planned programs.

As indicated in Table 3, the ministry experiences inadequate power supply (M=2.49). Electricity or

power supply remains the most critical element needed for any organization to perform its activities whether production, administrative or storage activities. Authors [18] assert that poor infrastructure including epileptic power supply negatively affects the performance of enterprises in agriculture. It is a widely acknowledged fact that the erratic power supply in Nigeria is the bane of economic and industrial development in the country [20]. With erratic power supply in the ministry, it implies that extra cost is incurred in purchasing and running generating sets.

Table 3 – Mean distribution of perceived level of infrastructure that poses a challenge in the State ministry of agriculture

Infrastructure challenges	Mean	S.D.
Inadequate equipment to execute agricultural programmes	2.54*	0.65
Insufficient electricity supply	2.49*	0.75
Inadequate pre and post-harvest storage facilities	2.44*	0.70
Inadequate maintenance of equipment and facilities	2.35*	0.74
Poor internet service	2.32*	0.81
Inadequate telecommunication facilities (Telephone)	2.30*	0.76
Inadequate conveniences (restroom and bath)	2.02*	0.81
Insufficient office space	1.85*	0.90

Notes: *Infrastructure challenges

Results in Table 3 further show the ministry had inadequate pre and post-harvest storage facilities (M=2.44) and inadequate maintenance of equipment and facilities (M=2.35). Researchers [10] stated that harvest and postharvest technologies save labor, reduce grain losses and improve product quality. Facilities that are not well maintained become devalued and dysfunctional. Poor maintenance incurs a great loss to the ministry and attracts additional costs to purchase new facilities. African Development Bank [2] stated that where facilities are inefficient and not properly maintained, there is a huge pre and post-harvest loss on the total attainable agricultural products.

Likewise, poor internet service (M=2.32), inadequate telecommunication facilities (telephone) (M=2.30), inadequate conveniences (restroom and bath) (M=2.02) and insufficient office space

(M=1.85) were other infrastructural challenges in the ministry. The Internet has great potentials of bringing agriculture closer to its clientele anywhere and enabling staff to communicate easily in the ministry [25]. It enhances knowledge building, information receiving, and dissemination towards efficient service delivery and improved productivity of staff in the ministry. Lack of internet service and other ICT facilities generates less access to information and low support of knowledge [13]. By implication, the staff of the ministry does not have a proper and effective communication channel. Knowledge enhancement without ICT facilities slows down efficient service delivery.

The telephone is the commonest telecommunication facility used between farmers and extension agents. Serious limitations of access to reliable telephones make intra- and inter-organizational networking for information exchange a frustrating experience [5]. Limited telecommunication channels in the ministry influence monitoring and follow up on the adoption of farm families. Insufficient telecommunication facilities between farmers and agriculture officers increase transaction costs since communication is more an agricultural practice which leads to increased productivity [22]. Implying that the means of reaching farm families on program adoption is difficult because telecommunication facilities are not provided for staff of the ministry.

Challenges to linkage formation of the ministry with stakeholders

Perceived linkage strength between the State ministry and other agencies. The ministry had strong link with the federal ministry of agriculture (M=2.36) and state ministry of finance (M=2.29). Federal ministry of agriculture is a ministry of the Nigerian government that regulates agricultural research, agriculture and natural resources, forestry and veterinary research throughout Nigeria. They work alongside the state ministry of agriculture towards achieving agricultural development [21].

The International Fund for Agricultural Development supports the Nigerian Government in poverty reduction programme in rural areas. It targets large numbers of smallholder farmers and is essentially people-centred through the various state ministry of agriculture. Author [1] stated that in Cross River State, IFAD is already

executing agricultural development programme (IFAD/FGN/NDDC Community Based Natural Resources Management Programme – CBNRMP) aimed at improving the livelihoods and living conditions of rural poor through institutional Strengthening and Community Development Fund interventions. Cross River State Government has in the last six years accessed four hundred and forty seven thousand dollars (\$447,000) from the International Fund for Agriculture Development for projects [28].

Table 4 – Mean distribution perceived linkage strength between the State ministry of agriculture and other agencies

Agencies	Mean (M)	S.D.
Federal ministry of agriculture	2.36*	0.83
Ministry of finance	2.29*	0.83
International fund for Agricultural development	2.20*	0.86
Farmer groups	2.15*	0.86
World Bank	2.05*	0.94
Agricultural bank	1.72*	0.83
Ministry of Land	1.69*	1.08
African Development Bank	1.64*	1.00
Ministry of information	1.63*	0.87
Ministry of housing and environment	1.44	1.02
Non-Governmental Organizations	1.40	0.85
Microfinance banks	1.38	0.94
Research institutes	1.37	1.00
Universities	1.31	1.04
Private agricultural extension outfits	1.31	0.98
National Food Reserve Agency	1.29	1.06
Ministry of Education	1.17	0.86
Engineering firms	1.16	0.87
Regulatory agencies (NAFDAC / SON)	0.85	0.94
Nigerian National Petroleum Corporation	0.32	0.59
Shell Petroleum Development company	0.30	0.58

Notes: *Agencies the ministry has strong links with

World Bank partners with the state ministry to implement and execute some agricultural programmes such as Fadama. Farmer groups most times suffer from poor leadership, poor managerial skills, weak financial base and poor access to

resources and services [30], that is the reason the state ministry works through the extension agents to educate and train the group for improved skills and coordinate them to access resources for their farm productivity. African Development Bank collaborates with the ministry to execute some projects that benefit grass root farmers. The implementation of the Rural Access Mobility Project was possible because it was funded by the bank [8].

Furthermore, the ministry had a weak linkage with universities (M=1.31) and research institutes (M=1.37). Public universities in Nigeria are under the ministry of education, while the agricultural research institutes are under a different ministry. In practice, there is no formal linkage existing between the universities and agricultural research institutes. What exists is antagonism. Similarly, there are no provisions for any linkages between the Ministry of Agriculture (federal and state) with universities. The study of the linkages between the ADP, an arm of the ministry of agriculture and the universities in Nigeria reported limited linkage and interactions.

Research institutes help to improve the productivity level of farmers with the aid of the ministry of agriculture transmitting innovative ideas through extension officers. Therefore, the absence of an effective linkage between agricultural research institutes and agricultural ministry or systems has repeatedly been reported as one of the major reasons for the low productivity experienced in the agricultural sector [16].

Issues affecting linkage between the ministry of agriculture and other agencies. Table 5 shows that issues affecting the ministry informing linkage with stakeholders are poor funding (M=2.54), insufficient research materials (M=2.45), weak mobility of experts or professionals (M=2.21), low ICT skills of staff (M=2.17), lack of training of staff on linkage knowledge (M=2.15). The interrelationship between the ministry and other agencies can be achieved through the collaboration of programs and attendance of staff of the ministry of agriculture to programs organized by other agencies such as the research institutes. Agricultural research is one of the driving forces behind the development of the agricultural sector. The effectiveness of agricultural research depends to a large extent on the ways in which the knowledge generated is transferred to farmers.

Table 5 – Mean distribution of indicators on linkage challenges between the State ministry of agriculture and other agencies

Indicators of Linkage challenges	Mean (M)	S.D.
Funding of ministry interrelationship activities	2.54*	0.67
Absence of research materials	2.45*	0.71
Mobility of experts/professionals	2.21*	0.79
ICT skills of staff of the ministry	2.17*	0.91
Training of staff on linkage knowledge	2.15*	0.83
Agricultural Policies in the state ministry of agriculture and other agencies	2.08*	0.78
Qualified human resources for linkage leadership	2.01*	0.86
Feedback mechanisms between research institutes and the state ministry	1.98*	0.93
Organizational rigidness by the ministry	1.90*	0.79
Personnel exchange between ministry and agencies	1.86*	0.90
Collaboration of programme by ministry	1.86*	0.87
Poor communication between the ministry of agriculture and other ministry in the implementation and execution of programme	1.80*	0.86

Notes: *Linkage challenges

Generally, lack of research poses constraints to the agricultural sector [30], these constraints constitute serious limitations to the research capacity and research capability of the ministry [6, 14, 24]. Linkage knowledge of the staff of the ministry can only be improved through training on its importance. But where such training is lacking staff knowledge on linkage is low. According to [23], upgrades of training and skills in linkage management issues are very paramount for staff involvement in the linkage.

Other indicators of linkage challenge in the ministry (Table 5) are very poor feedback mechanism between research institutes and the state ministry (M=1.98), agricultural policy issues in program execution (M=2.08). Feedback is said to be what makes communication complete, so where the findings made by research institutes are not brought back to the ministry for proper implementation and adoption, feedback is said to

be absent or poor which in turn affects both the research institute and the development of the state ministry of agriculture. According to [3] feedback between research institutes, state ministry and farmers can be improved by developing strong linkage, but most times this is not the case. In addition, [4] noted that the research system in place for agriculture faces a number of problems like lack of strong research-extension-farmer linkages and inadequate funding. Feedback should be specific, timely and be against the pre-determined performance expectations and should be provided on a continuous basis – daily, weekly or monthly reviews [17]. Lack of feedback in the ministry could be because of the inadequate fund to acquire the needed information or lack of mobility to reach the farmers and low exposure to the understanding of the need for feedback.

Organizational rigidness is when there's no flexibility in performing some of the policies that govern an organization towards achieving its set goals and objectives. When the ministry of agriculture has organizational rigidness, it influences developmental changes. According to [9], organizational rigidity is rather an ambiguous explanation for a firm's failure to capitalize on new opportunities and, consequently, perform better, despite its impediments to organizational change.

Communication between the ministry and other agencies towards implementing and executing an agricultural program is distorted when there is no sense of connectivity or interrelationship or information dissemination between both partners sometimes occasioned by rigidity. Author [23] indicated that private-public interaction on agricultural research, priority-setting methods in research organizations, the introduction of management solutions to improve the morale of personnel, communication within and between agricultural organizations and modernization efforts to improve client focus can pose a challenge to agricultural development.

Strategies for addressing the infrastructure challenges of the ministry. Entries in Table 6 shows that providing good office accommodation and renovating old ones was suggested (24.5%) as a measure to reduce infrastructural challenges, others include providing ICT equipment (20.0%), provision of constant electricity (18.2%) making funds available for maintenance of infrastructure (16.4%). These are in line with suggestions made

by [2] and [13] who made reference to the maintenance of equipment, provision of facilities and availability of funds as very vital for effective personnel performance in the ministry of agriculture

Table 6 – Percentage distribution of respondents on strategies for addressing infrastructure challenges of the State ministry

Infrastructure strategies suggestion	Percentage (%)
Upgrade office furniture and equipment	13.6
Provide good office accommodation and renovate old ones	24.5
Provision of ICTs equipment	20.0
Generator/power plant or constant power	18.2
Provision of storage facilities for some departments	17.3
Make funds available for maintenance	16.4
Prompt provision of needed infrastructure	11.8
Network with media/communication agencies	6.4
Improved security for infrastructure	2.7
Good roads for easy transportation of agricultural produce	1.8
Provide infrastructure at local government areas	0.9

Notes: *Multiple responses

Suggested strategies to address the linkage challenges of the ministry. Entries in Table 7 show that respondents suggested that funding for research work and facilities (32.1%) would help reduce some linkage issues, also, training staff on linkage issues (31.7%) and intensification of linkage between MOA and research institutes (25.5%). Author [3], after taking note of the constraints which hinder linkage between the ministry of agriculture and research institute, suggested regular contact to promote a better understanding of how best to serve the needs of overall agricultural development. The importance of training and development is obvious given the growing complexity of the work environment, the rapid change in organizations and advancement in technology. Therefore, training

organizational members to possess the knowledge and skills needed to perform their job effectively, take new responsibilities and adapt to ever-changing conditions is important [15].

Table 7 – Percentage distribution of respondents suggested strategies to address linkage challenges of the State ministry

Linkage strategy suggestion	Percentage (%)
Funding for research materials	32.7
Train staff on linkage knowledge	31.8
Intensifying linkage between MOA and research institutes	25.5
Interagency collaboration	21.8
Increased mobility of experts and professionals	9.1
Proper execution of feedback information	6.4
Appointment of liaison officers to strengthen existing linkages	5.5
Up to date publication of MOA's linkage activities	5.5
Improved partnership between the three tiers of government	0.9

Notes: *Multiple responses

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

There is gross inadequacy in infrastructure and linkage formation between the Cross River State Ministry of Agriculture and key stakeholders. This should be properly checked to avoid further deterioration and failure in agricultural program implementation in the state. Hence efforts should be made by the state government and the ministry in the following areas to help ameliorate the situation:

Offices should be renovated especially by replacing some leaking roofs, repainting the walls, demolishing and rebuilding the old non-spacious offices to accommodate the expected staff strength.

The ministry of agriculture should intensify its linkage with other agencies and research institutes through inter-agency collaboration, mobility of linkage experts and proper training of staff on the linkage.

Needed equipment and facilities should be purchased for various departments to improve productivity.

REFERENCES

1. Abang, M. (2013, May 15). Cross River spends N350m on IFAD, FGN, NDDC programmes. *BusinessDay*. Retrieved from <https://businessday.ng/agriculture/article/cross-river-spends-n350m-on-ifad-fgn-nddc-programmes/>
2. African Development Bank. (2011). *Infrastructure and Agricultural Productivity in Africa*. Retrieved from <https://www.afdb.org/fileadmin/uploads/afdb/Documents/Publications/Infrastructure%20and%20Agricultural%20Productivity%20in%20Africa%20FINAL.pdf>
3. Agbamu, J. U. (2000). Agricultural research–extension linkage systems: an international perspective. *Agricultural Research and Extension Network, 106a*. Retrieved from <https://www.odi.org/sites/odi.org.uk/files/odi-assets/publications-opinion-files/8202.pdf>
4. Alila, P. O., & Atieno, R. (2006). *Agricultural policy in Kenya: issues and processes*. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/228375704_Agricultural_policy_in_Kenya_Issues_and_processes
5. Arokoyo, T. (2011). ICTs application in agricultural extension service delivery. In M. C. Madukwe, *Agricultural extension in Nigeria* (p. 324). Ilorin: Agricultural Extension Society of Nigeria.
6. Chapman, R., & Slaymaker, T. (2002). *ICTs and Rural Development: Review of the Literature, Current Interventions and Opportunities for Action*. Retrieved from <https://www.odi.org/sites/odi.org.uk/files/odi-assets/publications-opinion-files/2670.pdf>
7. Cross River State Ministry of Agriculture. (2012). *Service charter for agriculture in Cross River State*.
8. Daily Times, (2013, January 15). African Development Bank commends Cross River for implementing RAMP project. *Daily Times NG*. Retrieved from <http://www.dailytimes.com.ng/article/african-development-bank-commends-cross-river-implementing-ramp-project>
9. De Figueiredo, R. J. P., Rawley, E., & Rider, C. I. (2013). Why are Firms Rigid? A Study of Firm Age and Scope in Hedge Funds. *SSRN Electronic Journal*. doi: 10.2139/ssrn.2271655
10. Dobberman, A., & Nelson, R. (2013). *Opportunities and solutions for sustainable food production*. Retrieved from https://www.post2020hlp.org/wp-content/uploads/docs/Doberman-Nelson_Solutions-for-Sustainable-Food-Production.pdf
11. Dorward, A., Fan, S., Kydd, J., Lofgren, H., Morrison, J., Poulton, C., ... Wobst, P. (2004). Institutions and Policies for Pro-poor Agricultural Growth. *Development Policy Review, 22*(6), 611–622. doi: 10.1111/j.1467-7679.2004.00268.x
12. Federal Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development. (2001). *The New Nigerian Agricultural Policy Thrust*. Abuja: FMARD.
13. Glendenning, C. J., & Ficarelli, P. P. (2012). The relevance of Content in ICT Initiatives in Indian Agriculture. Retrieved from <http://ebrary.ifpri.org/utils/getfile/collection/p15738coll2/id/126906/filename/127117.pdf>
14. Heeks, R. (2002). Information Systems and Developing Countries: Failure, Success, and Local Improvisations. *The Information Society, 18*(2), 101–112. doi: 10.1080/01972240290075039
15. Iwuoha, C. C. (2009). Impact of training and development programmes on secretaries' productivity in selected business organizations in Owerri, Imo state, Nigeria. *Journal of School of Business and Management and Technology, 1*(1), 106-110.
16. Kassa, B. (2009) *Agricultural research and extension linkages in Ethiopia: A historical survey*. Retrieved from <https://studylib.net/doc/7845526/agricultural-research-and-extension-linkage-in-ethiopia>
17. Lee, C. D. (2005). Rethinking the goals of your performance-management system. *Employment Relations Today, 32*(3), 53–60. doi: 10.1002/ert.20075

18. Manyong, V. M., Ikpi, A., Olayemi, J. K., Yusuf, S. A., Omonona, B. T., Okoruwa, V., Idachaba, F. S. (2005). *Agriculture in Nigeria: identifying opportunities for increased commercialization and investment*. Retrieved from <https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/5207/e6eb792dac5fae019a5b4e172dc1526ad4cf.pdf>
19. Odhiambo, W. (2007). *Financing African agriculture: issues and challenges*. Retrieved from <https://www.afdb.org/fileadmin/uploads/afdb/Documents/Knowledge/25120395-FR-ISSUES-AND-CHALLENGES-IN-FINANCIN-FINAL.PDF>
20. Ohajianya, A. C., Abumere, O. E., Owate, I. O., & Osarolube, V. (2014). *Erratic Power Supply in Nigeria: Causes and Solutions*. *International Journal of Engineering Science Invention*, 3(7), 51–55.
21. Ohen, S. B., Abang, S. O. (2011). *Evaluation of price linkages within the supply chain of rice markets in Cross River State, Nigeria*. *Journal of Agriculture and Social Research*, 11(1), 151–155.
22. Payne, J., McCarthy, S. (2010). *African agriculture and ICT: an overview*. Retrieved from <https://www.marketlinks.org/sites/marketlinks.org/files/resource/files/FACETProgramOverview.pdf>
23. Raina, R. (2003). Institutions and organizations: enabling reforms in Indian agricultural research and policy. *International Journal of Technology Management and Sustainable Development*, 2(2), 97–116.
24. Rao, N. H. (2007). A framework for implementing information and communication technologies in agricultural development in India. *Technological Forecasting and Social Change*, 74(4), 491–518. doi: 10.1016/j.techfore.2006.02.002
25. Richardson, D. (2006). *ICTs – Transforming Agricultural Extension?* Retrieved from <https://cgspace.cgiar.org/bitstream/handle/10568/63626/WD8034.pdf?sequence=1>
26. Saravanan, R. (Ed.). (2010). *ICTs for agricultural extension. Global experiments, innovations and experiences*. New Delhi: New India Publishing Agency.
27. Sorkaa, A. P. (2003). *Development as Ethics and Accountability in Governance: The way forward for Nigeria*. Benue state University Inaugural lecture series No. 1.
28. The Punch newspaper. (2019). *News*. Retrieved from <https://punchng.com/topics/news/>
29. Uzuegbunam, C. O., & Madukwe, M. C. (2007). Characteristics of linkages between the agricultural development programmes (ADPs) an universities of south eastern Nigeria. *Agro-Science*, 4(1). doi: 10.4314/as.v4i1.1514
30. Yusuf, K. A. (2012). *An appraisal of Research in Nigeria's University Sector*. *Journal of Research in National Development*, 10(2), 321–330.

Comparative Analysis of the Situation of Ethnic Minorities in Kosovo and the Republic of North Macedonia

Zenun Halili¹

¹ *University of Prishtina*

Rr. "George Bush", p. n., 10 000 Prishtinë, Republika e Kosovës

DOI: [10.22178/pos.52-5](https://doi.org/10.22178/pos.52-5)

LCC Subject Category: [KJE5-7975](#)

Received 28.10.2019

Accepted 28.11.2019

Published online 30.11.2019

Corresponding Author:

zenun.halili@uni-pr.edu

© 2019 The Author. This article is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License](#)



Abstract. This paper aims at discussing the matter of the national minorities in Kosovo and the Republic of North Macedonia. Role, position and the rights of the national minorities are the key focus of this study. While the Balkan countries and some European countries have had issues with recognizing and supporting the different ethnic communities living within their borders, Kosovo and the Republic of North Macedonia have, since their independence, recognized the existence of different communities as a given fact. Since gaining independence, they have constitutionally guaranteed all citizens freedom of association for the 'accomplishment and protection of their political, economic, social, cultural and other rights and beliefs. Being a geographical part of the Western Balkans, these two countries have been delayed in the European integration process even though their peoples and governments aspire to become part of the European Union. I think that national minorities have an important role in this process because, in the past, these two states have been characterized by a lack of respecting the rights of national minorities. For this reason, both countries have faced a lack of internal stability and conflict with each other as a result of the lack of respect for the rights of respective national minorities.

Keywords: Constitution; National Minorities; Constitutional rights; Ahtisaari plan; Ohrid Framework Agreement.

INTRODUCTION

Kosovo and the Republic of North Macedonia are two countries located in the Western Balkans area, a geographic area in Southeast Europe, where four of the great civilizations of the world have followed each other to produce a dynamic, diverse and versatile local civilization. This region has been a meeting point for the cultures of ancient Greece and Rome, Byzantium, Ottoman Turkey, and Catholic Europe, which clashed and once they merged. The Balkans is a region that no single culture was able to fully dominate [30]. Numerous conquests along with its geography have caused this small region to be inhabited by a large number of peoples which, over the centuries, have been mixed. Because of the imperial wars in the Balkan region, large population movements have taken place, while various religious and cultural influences led to the mix of Catholic and Orthodox Christianity with Islam. This has affected Balkan peoples for thousands of years living within large multi-ethnic states.

The ending of the First World War, along with the ultimate destruction of the multinational em-

pires, marked the end of the process of creating national states, but unlike the Western and Central European countries such as Germany and Hungary which represented the best example of the national state [24], in the Balkans, the border-bound policy failed based on the principle of nationality and self-determination. Since borders in the Balkans have been determined arbitrarily, and some of these states, within them, hold several people without their will, the Western Balkans region has faced various conflicts. In such a situation, Albanians were found in Serbia and Macedonia, as well as Serbs in Kosovo. Each of them has aimed at showing the old roots in the Balkans, the origin and the right to own certain territories. To create homogeneous areas, some of the peoples of the Western Balkans have practiced assimilation, expulsion, and exchange of the population. In some areas more and some less, the attempt to assimilate national minorities has been a common practice in Western Balkan countries.

This paper is divided into five sections, which relate to the research question and the hypotheses

raised. The main question of this research is: What is the position and the rights of national minorities in Kosovo and the Republic of North Macedonia? Whereas the main hypothesis of this research is: 'Does the position of national minorities contribute to the stability of the political situation in Kosovo and the Republic of North Macedonia?' The first part explains the treatment of national minorities according to International Law. The second part analyses the history of the national minorities in Kosovo and the Republic of North Macedonia. The third section tackles the rights of minorities from the constitutional and legal perspective. The fourth section analyses the Progress Reports regarding the position of minorities in Kosovo and the Republic of North Macedonia. The fifth section contains the conclusions of this paper.

METHODOLOGY

The working methodology for the preparation of this research paper consists of different adequate methods, which are used for research purposes in the social sciences. The comparative analysis method is used to compare the data that was found in different sources, while the descriptive method is used to describe the legality of different processes, events, and circumstances. The other methods which are used to prepare this paper are: Theoretical Analysis Method which is used to explain, predict, and understand the events and developments that are dealt with in this paper, and the statistical method is used to analyze, interpret and report the research findings. The historical method is used to collect the historical information, and the synthesis method, to verify the facts and processes used in this paper.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Treatment of National Minorities according to the International Law

The problem of recognizing and protecting the rights of minorities is an early problem, which has been the subject of treaties between states. In the 19th century, the slow rise of contemporary international law began in the West, but the agreements reached during that century did little to protect the rights of minorities. They were aimed at ensuring stability and cooperation at

the state level. The problem of equality of nations drew more attention after the bourgeois French revolution. The first recognition and international guarantee of the rights of national minorities were made in the Vienna treaties of 1815, where Russia, Prussia, and Austria agreed to respect the nationality of their Polish citizens [6]. For pragmatic and humanitarian reasons, international law has been a protective instrument, because the issue of minorities has never been entirely incorporated in national legislation. In very few countries around the world, citizens share the same language or belong to the same national group [22]. For this reason, the general international law and customary law recognize the right of states to protect the interests of their people living outside their country.

Throughout history, various efforts have been made to protect cultural minorities and to bring to end possible conflicts between the majority and national minorities. At the beginning of the last century, bilateral treaties regulated the treatment of foreign nationals in other countries. This treaty system has been extended by providing a multilateral basis under the League of Nations mandate. But the treaties were inadequate because a national minority was protected from discrimination and oppression only if there was a 'mother country' that would be interested in them [22]. The problem of the protection of national minorities is also closely linked to the territorial integrity of states. Oftentimes, states are concerned that recognition of minority rights may threaten their territorial integrity. But, within the international community, a consensus has been reached that recognizing minority rights should not question the principle of territorial integrity and national unity of states. Despite the principles of non-intervention and territorial integrity, mother countries have expressed their desire to intervene to ensure the rights of national minorities. In the period between the two world wars, in a few countries efforts have been made to regulate the internal law and ensure the protection of national minorities. Whereas, the League of Nations, as in many other areas, was also powerless in protecting the rights of national minorities.

The end of World War II and the formation of the United Nations opened a door to human rights and their impact on international law [27]. The United Nations Charter, signed in San Francisco on 26 June 1945 by representatives of fifty nations, was the product of an evolutionary devel-

opment that lasted for many decades, even centuries [15]. But the Charter does not mention minorities in a particular way, instead, it emphasizes individual human rights. The major human rights interest at the San Francisco Conference had not provoked proposals for the protection of minorities, even though the League of Nations agreement did not mention them either. The fact that no amendment favoring the protection of minorities was made, makes it clear that instead, the Charter referred more to human rights related to the principle of non-discrimination.

After the Second World War, the European Convention on Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (ECHR) was established to protect human rights and to promote democracy throughout Europe. After it was signed in Rome on 4 November 1950, the Convention entered into force on 3 September 1953 [10]. All member states of the Council of Europe are party to the Convention which established the European Court of Human Rights. The European Convention is still the only international human rights treaty that has provided a high degree of individual protection as it gives the individual an active role in the international arena. The "Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities" is the main convention for the international protection of national minorities in Europe. The Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities (Convention) was adopted by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe in 1994 and entered into force in 1998. It is the first legally binding multilateral instrument devoted to the protection of minorities and is regarded as the most comprehensive international standard in the field of minority rights so far. To a large extent, it transforms the political commitments of the 1990 Copenhagen Document of the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE) into legal obligations [9].

In the post-Cold War era, a discourse on minority rights has gained legitimacy in international debates. This discourse is analytically reflected in the work of Will Kymlicka [11]. He argues that the international debate on minority rights ended after the Cold War, as minority rights issues are considered not only 'exclusively a domestic affair' of a state but more as international-level issues. At the same time, minority rights and their respect have created new conflicts in the former Yugoslavia, where many minorities already belonged to the new states.

National Minorities in Kosovo and the Republic of North Macedonia

Republic of Kosovo and the Republic of North Macedonia, have been constituting parts of the former Yugoslavian Federation. But despite being part of the state of Yugoslavia, Albanians and Macedonians did not forget their national identity. Unlike the Republic of North Macedonia, which gained independence in 1991, Kosovo has a different history from all Western Balkan countries. It had a different status from other republics in the former Yugoslav Federation and was the last to get the independence. In Kosovo, relations between the local Albanian minority and the dominant Serbs, a numerical minority in Kosovo but a political majority in then Yugoslavia, were marred by violence throughout the 1990s. The government systematically repressed the Kosovo Albanians, who declared independence, organized parallel institutions, and launched nonviolent civil resistance. In 1998–1999 the conflict escalated to internal warfare and NATO military intervention, the defeat of the Serbian government, and a new period in Kosovo's political development characterized by the rule of the UN Interim Administration Mission in Kosovo (UNMIK) and the presence of NATO peacekeeping forces [20]. During the post-conflict period, the group switched positions. Albanians became a political majority in Kosovo, and Serbs a political minority.

The process of the final status of Kosovo was very difficult. In the years after the war, various international negotiations, as well as less formal mediation efforts, proved unsuccessful in resolving Kosovo's status. 'Violent ethnic rioting in March 2004 compelled the international community to step up these efforts' [31]. After 15 rounds of talks between Kosovo and Serbia delegations, to reach a political solution for Kosovo's status, on 10 March 2007, the Special Envoy of the UN Secretary-General Martti Ahtisaari prepared the Comprehensive Proposal for the Kosovo Status Settlement. Kosovo would declare supervised independence but had to agree to implement the Ahtisaari Package, or at least incorporate it into its law [19]. By the end of December 2007, the European Union, the United States, and Russia were still unable to find a solution to the final status of Kosovo. Nevertheless, on February 17, 2008, the representatives of the people of Kosovo solemnly proclaimed the Independ-

ence of Kosovo [17]. In June 2008, as Kosovo's constitution took effect, at the same time, Serbs in Northern Kosovo established parallel government institutions. The earlier contradictions between the Serbian and Albanian populations in the post-war period of 1998-1999 became even greater. The no-confidence gap was broadened despite the presence of the international factor and their peace efforts. The status issue and the different perspectives for the past and the common future made coexistence difficult in the new reality. Dominant communities, Albanians and Serbs, with the encouragement of international institutions, had to build a common future with other Kosovo minorities.

According to data from the population and housing census in 2011, Kosovo's population counted 1,739,825, excluding northern Kosovo, and had the following ethnic composition: 92.2% Albanians, 1.5% Serbs, 1.6% Bosnians, 0.6% Gorani, 0.5% Roma, 0.6% Egyptians, 0.9% Ashkali 1.1% Turks and 0.6% 'Other' or Not Specified [21]. Serbs living in northern Kosovo are the main problem in the country. On the other hand, Serbs living in other parts of the country are more cooperative and have begun to integrate into the new reality of Kosovo. Three religions: Islam, Orthodoxy, and Catholicism, have long coexisted in Kosovo. A large majority of Kosovo Albanians consider themselves, at least nominally, to be Muslim. A minority, about 60,000, are Catholic. Most Kosovo Serbs, even those who are not actively religious believers, consider Orthodoxy to be an important component of their national identity. Nevertheless, despite this essential division of religious activities along ethnic lines, it cannot be said that religion per se was an important contributing factor in the conflict between Serbs and Albanians [18].

The Republic of North Macedonia gained independence in a peaceful path, refusing to engage in wars that were taking place in the former Yugoslavia. However, during the period of transition and state-building, political, economic and inter-ethnic disagreements appeared. In Macedonia, interactions between the Macedonian majority and the Albanian minority were consistently tense. The Albanians were represented in parliament as early as 1990 and belonged to the governing coalitions since 1992, but their demands to be a constituent people of the state were perpetually ignored [20]. These tensions culminated at the beginning of 2001, with the armed uprising of ethnic Albanians, against Mac-

edonia's constitutional order, which ended with a political solution by signing the Ohrid agreement. In the aftermath, inter-ethnic violence significantly decreased and The Republic of North Macedonia became a candidate for EU membership.

According to the latest census in 2002, the total population of North Macedonia was 2,022,547, and it had the following ethnic composition: 64.2% Macedonians, 25.2% Albanians, 3.9% Turks, 2.7% Romani, 1.8% Serbs, 0.8% Bosnians, 0.5% Aromanians, and 0.9% other / unspecified. The largest ethnic group was the Macedonians. The second-largest is the Albanians, who are concentrated in the northwestern part of the nation. Estimates indicate a Roma population of up to 260,000. Up to 65% of the population follows Orthodox Christianity, with most belonging to the Macedonian Orthodox Church. Other Christian denominations account for 0.4% of the population. Muslims account for 33% of the population. Macedonia has the 5th highest proportion of Muslims in Europe. Most of the Muslims in the country are Turks, Roma or Albanians, although there is a small number of Macedonian Muslims [28].

Constitutional and Legal Position of the National Minorities in Kosovo and the Republic of North Macedonia

One of the characteristics of democracy is 'Majority Leadership and Respect for Minorities'. In every genuine democracy today, majority rule is both endorsed and limited by the supreme law of the constitution, which protects the rights of individuals. Kosovo and the Republic of North Macedonia as two new democratic states have chosen an affirmative approach about national minorities. The Constitution of the Republic of Kosovo provides certain guarantees for communities living in its territory. The status process itself, but also the events that preceded Kosovo's final status, had imposed a fairly privileged position of Communities. The Kosovo Constitution uses the term 'communities and their members' from a different viewpoint, these communities mean 'national minorities' [2]. The basis of the favorable constitutional position of communities in Kosovo is the Ahtisaari plan. The Ahtisaari plan foresaw comprehensive and specific rights for minority communities, which were later incorporated into the Kosovo constitution which entered into force in June 2008 [4]. This plan provides minorities, particularly the Serb minori-

ty, rights that no other minority enjoys in Europe.

The rights of national minorities in the Republic of North Macedonia have been advanced with the Constitution of 1991, supplemented and amended by constitutional amendments stemming from the Ohrid Agreement. It is considered that with the signing of the Ohrid Agreement, on 13 August 2001, a more significant advancement of the position of national minorities took place. This agreement represents the basis for Macedonia's democratization and a compromise on the fundamental rights and freedoms of national minorities in the country [3]. The Constitution of the Republic of Kosovo in its third chapter has foreseen a special system of the position of ethnic, religious and cultural groups, which are recognized as communities in the constitutional system of the Republic of Kosovo.

Article 57, of the Constitution of Kosovo, contains some general principles of the rights of communities and their members. The special status of communities and their special position is thus seen in the first paragraph of this article which states that "communities enjoy special rights outlined in the constitution, in addition to the freedoms and human rights that the Constitution of the Republic of Kosovo has foreseen in the second chapter" [7]. Annex II (Article 3) of the Ahtisaari plan provides the communities and their members with the right to express, preserve and develop their language and culture, receive pre-school, elementary and secondary public education in their languages, to establish and maintain their publicly funded private schools, to expose their national symbols and to have their media [29]. One of the special commitments of the Republic of Kosovo is the protection of the cultural and religious heritage of communities. The legal language used in Article 58, Paragraph 5 of the Constitution of Kosovo implies this commitment. Paragraph 14 of Article 59 of the Constitution of the Republic of Kosovo has provided for the right of communities to establish associations of culture, art, science and other associations that serve communities in the preservation and promotion of their culture. The official languages in the Republic of Kosovo are Albanian and Serbian. The Turkish, Bosnian and Roma languages have the status of official languages at the municipal level.

The Macedonian people have been and continue to be aware that for centuries in its territory in

North Macedonia they have lived and continue to live together with other nationalities, of which the Albanian and Turkish nationalities are most numerous [23]. The rights of national minorities in Macedonia are defined by the constitution and the law. The Constitution of the Republic of Macedonia in its Article 9 guarantees that 'Citizens of the Republic of Macedonia are equal in their freedoms and rights, regardless of gender, race, the color of skin, national and social origin, political and religious conviction, property and social status. Citizens are equal before the Constitution and the law'. In its Eighth Amendment, the Macedonian Constitution guarantees members of national minorities the right to cultivate and develop their identity and the use of national symbols. The Constitution guarantees all minorities the protection of ethnic, cultural, linguistic and religious identity [8]. As in Kosovo, national minorities in Macedonia have the right to establish cultural, artistic, educational and scientific associations. The right of national minorities to learn in their mother tongue is determined by law. Article 19 of the Constitution guarantees freedom of religion. In the entire Republic of North Macedonia, the official language is Macedonian. Any other language spoken by at least 20 percent of the population is also an official language, as defined by law.

Representation of national minorities in public life and decision-making

Citizens belonging to different communities in Kosovo have the right to form political parties and to run for positions and posts at all levels of government. In Kosovo, there is a large number of political parties registered and fortunately, all communities are represented by one or more parties [16]. The Constitution of the Republic of Kosovo has provided a commodity about the participation of communities in public life and decision-making. Such participation is especially noticed in the legislative, executive and judicial powers. The Assembly of the Republic of Kosovo, as the bearer of the sovereignty of the people, is the body in which the communities living in Kosovo are represented. Communities are represented in the chairmanship and assembly committees. Of all the members of the Presidency of the Assembly of the Republic of Kosovo, a member is from the Serb community and a member of other communities [1].

The Constitution of North Macedonia (1991) has laid the foundations for building a new political, economic and legal development of the Republic as a sovereign and independent state. It is important that among the fundamental values of the constitutional order of the Republic of Macedonia are set the political pluralism, free democratic elections and the division of state powers into legislative, executive and judicial [8]. The division of state power increases the efficiency of the judicial system, creating the legal basis for each institution to carry out its activity in an independent manner. This affects the strengthening of the rule of law and respect for the fundamental freedoms and rights of citizens. In this regard, the issue of adequate representation of representatives of national minorities, in all public institutions and bodies of state power is of special importance. According to Article 23 of the Constitution, every citizen of the Republic of Macedonia has the right to participate in the performance of public duties. As in Kosovo, Sovereignty in the Republic of Macedonia derives from the citizens and belongs to the citizens. Based on Article 2 of the Constitution, the citizens of the Republic of North Macedonia exercise their authority through democratically elected Representatives, through referendum and other forms of direct expression.

Political representation of communities in the Assembly of Kosovo is also done through reserved seats or guaranteed seats. Reserved or guaranteed seats are the most unique way of representing communities in the constitutional system of the Republic of Kosovo. This mode of representation was designed in the Ahtisaari plan, which constitutes a rare practice of representing a particular ethnic, religious or cultural group [29]. Out of 120 seats in the Assembly of the Republic of Kosovo, 20 of them are reserved or guaranteed for the communities. Serbian representatives are guaranteed 10 seats, Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities are guaranteed four seats, Bosnians three, two Turks, and one for Gorani representative. About this way of community representation, it is also interesting how the community's decision-making in the Assembly is concerned. Communities use the so-called double majority or that of Badinter, when it comes to assembly decisions that directly affect the interests of communities, including so-called vital legislation. Most of Badinter or most of the double voting is also used in the Assembly of the Republic of North Macedonia when it comes to

the adoption of laws related to the use of language, culture, personal documents, education and the use of symbols. For every minority-related decision and their members, two-thirds of the votes of all MPs are required, and the majority of the votes of MPs who belong to minorities that are not in the majority in Macedonia. This constitutional mechanism emerged from the 2001 Ohrid Agreement, which is the basis for the democratization of Macedonia and the preservation of the multi-ethnic character of the state.

Another important level of community representation in the Republic of Kosovo is the representation of minorities in executive power. Guarantees for such representation, as well as in the Assembly, have emerged from the Ahtisaari plan, which in Articles 5.1 and 5.2 of Annex 1 provides for the representation of communities at the level of ministers and deputy ministers. Article 96 of the Constitution of Kosovo also regulates the division of power for communities into state executive bodies, while the Kosovo government is obliged to have a composition involving minority parties. According to Article 96 of the Constitution, the Serb community must be represented by one minister, and that one minister must be appointed from another minority community; a third minister from a minority community can also be appointed if the Kosovo government has more than 12 ministries. The Serb community is politically superior and dominates with their political superiority about other communities. In December 2008, the Government of the Republic of Kosovo approved the Strategy for the Integration of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian Communities in the Republic of Kosovo 2009-2014, as well as the Action Plan for its implementation, but despite guaranteed representation through reserved seats in Kosovo's key legislative and executive bodies, Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities in Kosovo are among the most discriminated, poorest, and most vulnerable communities in Kosovo society.

In addition to declaring independence, Macedonia started the democratic transition, implementing a multi-party system and pluralistic elections. Unlike Kosovo, where Albanians during the years of occupation did not participate in the elections that the Serbian government organized in Kosovo, in the Republic of Northern Macedonia, Albanian political entities participated in elections and government structures alongside numerous Macedonian parties. Macedonia has been governed by broad coalitions including Macedonian

and Albanian parties, as well as occasionally parties of other smaller minorities, since the first free elections in 1991. This system of government formation, not a constitutional requirement, but a tradition that has developed since the end of one-party rule, has not been directly affected by the Ohrid Agreement [5]. The pure multi-ethnic composition is also reflected in the Justice System in Kosovo and Macedonia. In the entire judicial system of the Republic of Kosovo, the maximum participation rate of non-majority communities is 15 percent. This norm of representation, except in the Ahtisaari Package, is standardized in the Constitution of the Republic of Kosovo [7]. The Constitutional Court of the Republic of Kosovo, as a body for the protection of the constitution, includes in its composition non-majority communities. Out of a total of nine judges, two of them belong to communities.

The Republic of Macedonia, since its independence, has made considerable efforts to improve the position of the nationalities in various areas. The nationalities are also represented in the judiciary: in the Constitutional Court, three of the nine members, and in the Judicial Council of the Republic, two of the seven members, belong to nationalities. In the basic courts, 87% of the 477 elected judges are Macedonians, 6.9% are Albanians, 2.5% are Vlachs, 1.8% are Serbs, 0.6% are Turks and Muslims each, and 0.8% belong to other nationalities. In the courts of appeal, 84% of the 88 elected judges are Macedonians, 9.1% are Albanians, 2.2% are Turks and Serbs, and 1.14% are Vlachs and other nationalities. In the Supreme Court of the Republic of Macedonia, four of the 25 judges are Albanians and one member is of the Vlach nationality [25].

In both countries, national minorities are represented in all institutions and levels of government. Representation in local government bodies is a very important mechanism for realizing community rights both in Kosovo and in Macedonia. Local Governance in the Republic of Kosovo is regulated by the Constitution, giving all citizens of Kosovo the right to representation in local government. It should be mentioned that local government, especially the decentralization process, is one of the issues dealt with in the Ahtisaari Package. This document emphasizes that "Local Self-Government in Kosovo will be based on the principles of good governance, transparency, efficiency and effectiveness in the delivery of public services, paying particular attention to the needs and concerns of the non-

majority communities and their members" [29]. Power-sharing among various ethnic groups in the society of Macedonia started after the 2001 conflict and with the OFA agreement. There was a municipality restructuring in August 2004, which was supposed to serve as a mechanism that would allow Albanians and other ethnic groups to have more decentralized power in exercising their duties and rights [26]. Ahtisaari's Package and the Ohrid Agreement have created the basis for minority representation in the police, army and intelligence services. Viewed comparatively, Kosovo stands better than Macedonia in this regard.

Communities in Kosovo except in other bodies are also represented in the Presidency of the Republic of Kosovo. This representation is achieved through the Community Consultative Council acting under the authority of the President of the Republic. This council is made up of representatives of various associations of communities living in Kosovo. The mandate and scope of the consultative council for communities are defined by the Constitution of the Republic of Kosovo in Article 60. We encounter a representation of this nature in the Republic of North Macedonia. Following the Constitution, the Assembly of the Republic of Macedonia establishes a Council for Inter-Ethnic Relations to be composed of the following: the President of the Assembly and two members representing Macedonians, Albanians, Turks, Vlachs, Roma, respectively and two members representing other national minorities. Similar commission on Inter-Ethnic Relations, by the Law on Local Self-Government, could be established within the Council of the unit of the local self-government [8].

Progress Reports regarding the position of minorities in Kosovo and the Republic of North Macedonia

While North Macedonia's accession to the European Union (EU) has been on the current agenda for future enlargement of the EU since 2005, Kosovo is recognized by the EU as a potential candidate for accession. Being the last state from the Balkan Peninsula, in 2015, Kosovo signed with EU Stabilization and Association Agreement [12]. Although among the countries of the Western Balkans, Kosovo has the most mechanisms focused on the rights of non-majority communities, both at the central and local level, the launching of its membership process in the European Union

offers stronger guarantees for respect of human rights and freedoms, as well as the rights of minority communities.

According to the politicians and their population, Kosovo and the Republic of North Macedonia are determined to fulfill the Copenhagen Criteria and other conditions that candidate countries must meet before they can become members of the European Union. To understand the fulfillment of these criteria, the European Commission publishes the Annual Progress Reports for Western Balkan Countries. Let us present and analyze some of the findings of the European Commission Progress Reports on the Situation of National Minorities in Kosovo and the Republic of North Macedonia.

The 2018 EU Commission Progress Report, which measures progress in Kosovo across a range of areas, does not speak in terms of minority rights but human rights. The legal framework of Kosovo broadly guarantees the protection of human and fundamental rights in line with European standards.

However, according to the 2018 Progress Report, "additional efforts are needed regarding enforcement, Implementation of human rights strategies and legislation is often undermined by inadequate financial and other resources, particularly at the local level, limited political prioritization and lack of coordination" [13].

The Progress Report, states 'that more needs to be done to effectively guarantee the rights of persons belonging to minorities, including Roma and Ashkali and displaced persons, to ensure gender equality in practice, and to advance the protection of cultural heritage'. As in Kosovo, in the Republic of North Macedonia too, the legal framework is broadly in line with European standards. According to the 2018 Progress Report on Macedonia, 'the reforms have been undertaken to enhance compliance with European human rights standards'. The Progress Report states that 'the country took an important step towards its gradual alignment with EU standards in the area of fundamental rights by becoming an observer in the Fundamental Rights Agency'.

"The country worked towards upgrading the legislative framework for nondiscrimination and started creating the legal conditions for establishing an external oversight mechanism of the police. However, there is a need to ensure legal follow-up of cases of hate crime and hate speech, to counter

gender stereotyping and strengthen the bodies involved in protecting and promoting human rights' [14].

The Report concludes that 'the implementation of human rights standards and policy documents continue to affect primarily the most vulnerable and marginalized groups in society, including persons with disabilities and Roma'.

Referring to the 2019 European Commission Progress Reports for Kosovo and the Republic of North Macedonia, some positive movement has been noticed regarding minority rights. The Progress Report further emphasizes that 'Kosovo has an adequate institutional and legal framework for the rights and protection of minorities, including relevant strategies and action plans, but implementation remains weak'. 2019 Report further states that:

'Greater coordination is needed at both central and local levels in support of minority communities. To promote a lasting inter-ethnic co-existence, the government needs to step up its efforts to create the conditions for minority communities fully to exercise their rights. They continue to face challenges regarding a secure environment, regaining and accessing the property, civil registration, being able to use their language, adequate provisions for education, employment opportunities and social welfare'.

Regarding security issues, the 2019 European Commission Progress Report for Kosovo, finds that the overall security situation for minority communities remains stable. Nevertheless, according to the report, 'there are recurring incidents of property and livestock theft, which frequently affect Kosovo Serbs, as well as other minority communities. Such incidents, even when they are not ethnically biased, negatively influence the security perceptions of the affected community'. As far as the position of other minorities is concerned, the 2019 Progress Report, concludes that:

'The situation of the Roma and Ashkali communities remains challenging and, in spite of efforts, they still suffer from marginalization and discrimination, with women particularly affected. The poverty levels of these communities remain high compared to other communities in Kosovo'.

Furthermore, according to this report, compared to the previous situation, some improvements can be noted in the field of education. The Progress Report states that "The Ombudsperson In-

stitution of Kosovo continued to advance its mandate in promoting, protecting and upholding fundamental rights and freedoms for all and to strengthen its capacity to review cases'. The 2019 Progress Report indicates that North Macedonia has continued to maintain a steady pace of implementation of EU reforms throughout the reporting period. Regarding the protection of minorities, the 2019 Progress Report finds that:

'Work is ongoing to strengthen the legal framework on minorities in non-majority communities. The Parliament adopted the law enabling the establishment of a new Ministry of Political System and Inter-Community Relations. This Ministry would take over the functions of the Secretariat for the Implementation of the Ohrid Framework Agreement and directorates dealing with 32 communities' issues under the Ministry of Education and Science and the Ministry of Culture' rights'.

While the government shows commitment to the integration of all people, including through the work initiated on the drafting of a strategy under the motto 'One society for all', The report further states 'more work needs to be done on improving social cohesion'. The Progress Report finds that 'There is no system to monitor the implementation of the recommendations issued by the Advisory Committee of the Framework Convention on National Minorities, and existing measures, mainly funded by donors, are insufficient'. Regarding the position of the Roma community, which is considered to be the most discriminated minority in both Kosovo and North Macedonia, the 2019 Progress Report for North Macedonia finds that:

'Implementation of the Roma inclusion strategy (2014-2020) and corresponding action plans for education, employment, housing and gender, and health, is gradual and much remains to be done on Roma inclusion. The government is committed to continuously increasing funding for Roma integration policies, but the lack of expenditure monitoring, combined with the poor absorption of existing funds, remains a problem'.

According to a regional survey on Roma inclusion, the country has fared well compared to its neighbors, but even despite this, the Progress Report indicates that 'Segregation in school remains high, with 40% of marginalized Roma students attending majority Roma schools'. The 2019 Progress Report further finds that 'Regarding housing, the objective to reduce the gap be-

tween Roma and non-Roma citizens is progressing very slowly and most of the planned measures have not been implemented'. In the concluding part of the Progress Report on the position of marginalized minorities in the Republic of North Macedonia, it is stated that 'Systematic, rather than reactive measures by state institutions are required to address the concerns of Roma and other minorities'.

CONCLUSIONS

In conclusion, we can say that the problem of national minorities in Kosovo and North Macedonia has been a permanent problem as it has been in other Western Balkan countries. In these countries, efforts have always been made to refrain from accepting the existence of minorities or to minimize the number of national minorities. During the creation of the national state, the national minorities became 'an obstacle' and consequently communities belonging to these minorities suffered, faced displacement, and assimilation.

Recognizing the extreme Balkan nationalism system, political classes in Kosovo and the Republic of North Macedonia have over time realized that non-respect of respective national minorities has had negative consequences for their countries. Therefore, both countries have chosen affirmative approaches to national minorities, providing certain constitutional and legal guarantees for the communities living in their territory. Many of the problems of national minorities in Kosovo and North Macedonia have been caused by the lack of political will and fears that national minorities may have territorial claims and separatist tendencies.

The lack of will and deaf ears for minority rights has brought the opposite reaction in comparison to what the authorities have wanted. The stubbornness to hear the voice of Kosovo Albanians brought to the armed clash between them and Serbia, the clash that led to NATO intervention and independence of Kosovo. The same situation was repeated in North Macedonia, where Macedonian authorities felt frightened by the unconvincing idea that granting more rights to Albanians would bring their demands for detachment. This approach was wrong because the Albanians by their representatives made it clear that they did not demand the dissolution of Macedonia, but only its reformation and equal status with the Macedonians. The economic and political perse-

cution and persecution of the national minorities in the Republic of North Macedonia as well as in Kosovo did not weaken their efforts to gain more rights but strengthened them. Thus, it must be understood that the idea of the separation of national minorities does not depend solely on the will of the minority, but also the conduct of the majority and the central government. States that do not find common ground with minorities will always face objections coming from national minorities, which may escalate to violent opposition from dissatisfied minorities. Kosovo and the Re-

public of North Macedonia are examples in this aspect.

Democratization and respect for national minorities can help in preventing violent conflicts in divided societies, as is also shown by the study of the two cases we have dealt with in this paper. However, throughout Kosovo and the Republic of North Macedonia, much remains to be done to implement the Ahtisaari Package and Ohrid Framework provisions, which guarantee the progress of the rights of national minorities and the democratization of these two countries.

REFERENCES

1. Assembly of the Republic Kosovo. (2010). *Rregullorja e punës së Kuvendit të Kosovës*. Retrieved from http://www.kuvendikosoves.org/Uploads/Data/Files/6/Rr_K_RK_29_04_2010_1_EDbu8aqXYd.pdf
2. Bajrami, A. (2011). *Sistemi Kushtetues i Republikës së Kosovës*. Prishtinë: Kolegji AAB.
3. Bajrami, A., Halili, Z., Zejneli, J., & Muçaj, F. (2015). *Pozita Kushtetuese dhe Ligjore e Pakicave Kombëtare: Aspekte Krahasuese*. Prishtinë: Artini.
4. Beha, Adem. (2014). [Minority Rights: An Opportunity for Adjustment of Ethnic Relations in Kosovo?](#) *Journal on Ethnopolitics and Minority Issues in Europe*, 13(4), 85–110.
5. Bieber, F. (2005). Partial Implementation, Partial Success: The Case of Macedonia. In D. Russell, & I. O'Flynn (Eds.), *New Challenges for Power-Sharing: Institutional and Social Reform in Divided Societies* (pp. 107–122). London: Pluto.
6. Chászár, E. (1999). *The International Problem of National Minorities*. Buffalo: Mathias Corvinus Publishing.
7. Constitution of the Republic of Kosovo (Republic of Kosovo), 15.06.2008. Retrieved October 1, 2019, from <https://bit.ly/2SS9uAt>
8. Constitution of the Republic of North Macedonia (Republic of North Macedonia), 11.01.2019. Retrieved October 1, 2019, from www.sobranie.mk/the-constitution-of-the-republic-of-macedonia.nspk
9. Council of Europe. (1995 February). Framework convention for the protection of national minorities and explanatory report. Retrieved from <https://rm.coe.int/16800c10cf>
10. Drzemczewski, A. (1983). *European Human Rights Convention in Domestic Law: A comparative study*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
11. Ekonomia. (n. d.). *Të Drejtat e Pakicave: Mundësi për Rregullimin e Marrëdhënieve Etnike në Kosovë?* Retrieved October 1, 2019, from <http://ekonomia-ks.com/?page=1%2C20%2C360250>
12. European Commission. (2015). *Stabilisation and association agreement between the European Union, of the one part, and Kosovo, of the other part*. Retrieved from https://ec.europa.eu/neighbourhood-enlargement/sites/near/files/news_corner/news/news-files/20150430_saa.pdf
13. European Commission. (2019). *Kosovo 2019 Report*. Retrieved from <https://ec.europa.eu/neighbourhood-enlargement/sites/near/files/20190529-kosovo-report.pdf>

14. European Commission. (2019). *North Macedonia 2019 Report*. Retrieved from <https://ec.europa.eu/neighbourhood-enlargement/sites/near/files/20190529-north-macedonia-report.pdf>
15. Goodrich, L., Hambro, E. (1949). *Charter of the United Nations: Commentary and Documents* (2nd ed.). Boston: World Peace Foundation.
16. Gruda, Z. (2001). *Mbrojtja Ndërkombëtare e të Drejtave të Njeriut*. Prishtinë: Universiteti i Prishtinës.
17. Halili, Z. (2018). *State Building Challenges and the European Integration Process: The Kosovo Case*. *Eastern European Journal of Regional Studies*, 4(2), 4–17.
18. International Crisis Group. (2001, January 31). *Religion in Kosovo*. Retrieved from <https://www.crisisgroup.org/europe-central-asia/balkans/kosovo/religion-kosovo>
19. Judah, T. (2008). *Kosovo: What Everyone Needs to Know?* Oxford; New York: Oxford University Press.
20. Koinova, M. (2013). *Ethnonationalist conflict in postcommunist states: varieties of governance in Bulgaria, Macedonia, and Kosovo*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
21. Kosovo Agency of Statistics. (2011). *Estimation of Kosovo Population 2011*. Retrieved from <http://ask.rks-gov.net/media/2129/estimation-of-kosovo-population-2011.pdf>
22. Kymlicka, W. (2003). *Multicultural citizenship: a liberal theory of minority rights*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
23. Lumani, F. (2014). *E Drejta Kushtetuese*. Tetovë: IRIS.
24. Macartney, C. A. (1968). *National States and National Minorities*. New York: Russell & Russell.
25. Ortakovski, V. (2001). *Interethnic Relations and Minorities in the Republic of Macedonia*. *Southeast European Politics*, 2(1), 24–45.
26. Sejdini, M. K. (2016). An Overview of the Reformed Local Government in Macedonia. *Business and Economic Research*, 6(1), 440. doi: 10.5296/ber.v6i1.9350
27. Stearns, P. (2012). *Human Rights in World History*. New York: Routledge.
28. The State Statistical Office of the Republic of North Macedonia. *Population Census*. Retrieved from http://www.stat.gov.mk/OblastOpsto_en.aspx?id=31
29. United Nations. (2007, March 26). *Comprehensive Proposal for the Kosovo Status Settlement*. Retrieved from https://reliefweb.int/sites/reliefweb.int/files/resources/1DC6B184D02567D1852572AA00716AF7-Full_Report.pdf
30. Wachtel, A. (2008). *The Balkans in World History*. New York; Oxford: Oxford University Press.
31. Weitz, R. (2011). *War and Governance: International Security in a Changing World Order*. Santa Barbara: Praeger.

