Coordination of Academic Supervision of Supervisors and Principals towards the Learning Quality Improvement Process at SMK Negeri 1 Al-Mubarkeya Aceh Besar District, Indonesia

Masroel Afdal [1] **, Niswanto** [1] **, Bahrun** [1]

[1] *Syiah Kuala University*
Jln. Teuku Nyak Arief, Darussalam, Banda Aceh, Aceh, 23111, Indonesia

Abstract. Providing quality education requires setting up a cooperative relationship to achieve the goals of the educational organisation. The coordination of supervisors and principals in academic supervision aims to improve the quality of learning with existing educational resources effectively and efficiently. This study aimed to find out: 1) the planning of the academic supervision programme of supervisors and principals; 2) strategies in implementing Academic Supervision of Supervisors and Principals; 3) obstacles to Academic Supervision of Supervisors and Principals to the Learning Quality Improvement Process at SMK Negeri 1 Al-Mubarkeya, Aceh Besar Regency.

The subjects of this research are school supervisors, principals and teachers at SMK Negeri 1 Al-Mubarkeya Aceh Besar District - data analysis using descriptive qualitative, which includes data reduction, data presentation, and conclusion drawing. The study results are 1) The planning of the academic supervision programme by the principal is carried out at the beginning of the school year through a meeting with the teachers' council. The programme supervises learning devices, monitoring, learning process and learning outcomes assessment. 2) The strategy for implementing the academic supervision programme by the principal is carried out in four stages, namely: initial survey before conducting academic supervision, classroom visits, interviews outside the classroom and evaluation of the results of classroom visits and. 3) Obstacles in academic supervision, namely: limited time in supervising teachers, lack of personal, leadership and professional qualities, incentives from the government that are still lacking and, the motivation that is still lacking.

Keywords: Academy Supervision; Principal; Learning Quality.

INTRODUCTION

The teacher is the main character in creating a conducive learning atmosphere in the classroom. Authors [1] argue that: "Teachers are professional educators with the main task of educating, teaching, guiding, directing, training, assessing, and evaluating students in early childhood education through formal education, primary education, and secondary education. Simply put, the teacher is someone who imparts knowledge to students from those who do not know to know or those who do not understand. Teachers have a considerable influence on the teaching and learning process.

The role of the teacher is vital in increasing academic progress. The position of the teacher is central in the world of education in determining the output of education itself. One of the problems in the world of education is the low performance of teachers. The condition of teachers in Indonesia is very apprehensive. In general, teachers do not yet have sufficient professionalism to carry out their duties as stated in Article 39, paragraph 2 of Law No 20 of 2003, namely: "Educators are professionals whose job is to plan and carry out the learning process, assess learning outcomes, conduct mentoring and training, and conduct research and community service, especially for educators at tertiary institutions".

The fact is that what is currently happening is that the teacher assignment process is sometimes not by the teacher's educational background, resulting in teacher powerlessness in teaching. The fatal thing is that some students feel they are not getting the knowledge they should receive. Teachers need help to improve the quality of education. Assistance regarding how to solve academic problems through consultation, discussion, and coaching programs in solving learning problems. Supervisors and principals can assist through academic supervision in strengthening learning services.

Law No 20 of 2003 Chapter XI article 40 paragraph 2b explains that: "Educators and Education Personnel are obliged to have a professional commitment to improve the quality of Education". The quality of quality education is inseparable from the role of the component elements of an educational institution, such as school principals, teachers, school administrators, students, and the school facilities themselves.

Guidance, supervision and evaluation are needed so that the quality of learning in schools can run according to the principles of implementing academic leadership. After participating in the learning process, a learning experience, students are expected to acquire knowledge through knowledge transfer, skills, competencies, and mental maturity. So there is a shift from just Human Resources to human capital as evidence of progress and improvement in the quality of students after going through the academic process.

Coordination in the educational process is essential and required by all elements of education, such as supervisors, principals, teachers, student guardians, and the community, to achieve academic goals effectively and efficiently. This is to the opinion of Lindeke and Sieckert, who said, "Coordination is a complex process that requires knowledge sharing that is planned, intentional, and becomes a shared responsibility".

Periodic supervision is carried out by way of co-ordination academic supervision between school supervisors and principals to achieve the ideals of the Independence of the Republic of Indonesia in implementing a quality learning process.

They were placing the principal as someone with good experience and skills. The supervisor's role is more on guidance, and the responsibilities are relatively equally divided between supervisors as supervisors and school principals. Problem-solving is more open and two-way, and there is equality in practical understanding. Collaborative decision-making between supervisors and school principals leads to a framework of problems school principals face.

Implementing academic supervision and coordinating supervisors and school principals is critical in improving teachers' teaching quality and competence. Professional supervisors will conduct maintenance, implementation and evaluation plans and follow-up to achieve quality education.

Based on the observations, some educational institutions are interested in conducting special studies, namely, SMK Negeri 1 Al-Mubarkeya, Aceh Besar District. The school building was handed over from the Kuwait Red Crescent to the Regional Government of Aceh Besar on August 22 2013, with the establishment No 254 of 2014 and began operating when the first new student admissions took place in May 2014 under the name SMK Negeri 1 Al-Mubarkeya Want Jaya.

This school was the youngest vocational school of the seven SMKs in the Aceh Besar district at that time, with the first principal on behalf of Baihaqi, S. Pd, M. Pd with a Decree from the Head of the Aceh Besar District Education Office dated May 22, 2014, with SK No 166 of 2014. Al-Mubarkeya Vocational School is under the Aceh Education Office with the Principal Drs. Dahliati, M.Pd. according to Law No 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government, which caused SMA/SMK/LB to transfer management authority from the Regency/City Government to the Provincial Government.

SMK Negeri 1 Al-Mubarkeya is also cared for or fostered by the best provincial supervisor, the Provincial Supervisory Coordinator (Korwas) Drs. M. Akbari AR, MA. In addition, Al-Mubarkeya State Vocational School 1 also commits to "create smart, skilled and Islamic human resources in facing the Globalization Era" as stated in its vision, with its mission, namely: a) carry out the learning process by professional staff with an approach to local wisdom, faith and holiness; b) educate and train students who are skilled with information technology by the expertise program; c) educate and train students who are skilled and competitive in facing the global market; d) organising the learning process through a partnership pattern with the business world and industry.

Based on the description above, coordinating supervisors and school principals is essential in realising the achievement of a quality learning process carried out by teachers to provide satisfaction to student parents, the business world and the industry in producing quality graduates.

METHODS

This study used a qualitative approach with a descriptive research type. A qualitative approach, namely the approach used based on data stated by informants orally or in writing, as well as actual behaviour, is researched and studied based on facts in the field to determine coordination in academic supervision. According to [2], a qualitative descriptive approach is a research approach based on the philosophy of postpositivism used to research natural object conditions (as opposed to experiments) where the researcher is the key instrument. Data collection techniques are carried out by triangulation (combined), data analysis is inductive/qualitative, and the results of qualitative research emphasise meaning rather than generalisation.

Qualitative research, which is used as the subject, is only a source that provides complete and accurate information about several events, people, and observed situations. The author [3] states that: Qualitative researchers try to create a complex picture of a problem or issue under study. This involves reporting perspectives, identifying factors associated with a situation, and generally sketching the emerging big picture.

Furthermore, the author [4] states, "Research subjects are objects, things or people where the data for research variables are attached and are at issue". The subjects of this study were school supervisors, principals and teachers at SMK Negeri 1 Al-Mubarkeya.

According to [5], "Research instruments are tools for researchers to collect data or information relevant to research problems". In this study, the instruments used to collect data regarding the application of academic supervision are observation guidelines, interview guidelines, and documentation studies by asking questions that the research objectives have formulated to obtain answers that can be used as results of qualitative data whose validity can be accounted for and the truth.

Activities in qualitative data analysis are carried out interactively and continuously until complete, so the data is saturated. Interactive model data analysis starts from the stages of data reduction, data presentation and drawing conclusions or verification.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Planning is the first step towards the success of a job so that the work can run well and smoothly. Supervisors coordinate with SMKN 1 Al Mubarkeya Aceh Besar to plan academic supervision, which is carried out continuously. According to [6], "Planning for academic supervision aims to motivate teachers to improve competence including curriculum development, encouraging teacher involvement in work teams".

The author [7] argues, "One of the important activities that must be carried out is academic supervision to assess teacher performance in improving the quality of education". Planning for educational supervision is also a preparation for drawing up a decision in the form of steps to complete various teaching problem-solving processes as an aid to teacher professional services, which of course, is carried out with coordination between the school principal and school supervisors and other related parties. In preparing the planning for the academic supervision program, it can be seen that the supervisor and the principal work together to prepare the planning for the educational supervision program.

Then in preparing an academic supervision plan, the Supervisor and Head of SMKN 1, Al Mubarkeya Aceh Besar, do it at the beginning of the school year. The planning stages for academic supervision Supervisors and school principals start by preparing the educational supervision semester program; through meetings with the teacher council, the school principal conveys the program directly.

The school principal and supervisors' ability to coordinate the preparation of plans for the academic supervision program at SMKN 1 Al Mubarkeya is excellent. Coordination is essential in directing subordinates to achieve goals according to what was planned. Then, according to [2] about seeing the intensity of the coordination of the Principal and Supervisor in the implementation of academic supervision in this study, it can be seen from the existence of:

1) the state of the performance of academic management;

2) the intensity of coordination between the school principal and the school supervisor in implementing academic supervision;

3) coaching is carried out according to the procedure;

4) applying appropriate techniques in monitoring, evaluating and fostering academic supervision.

The focus in planning the academic supervision program delivered by the Principal and Supervisors includes teacher administration, implementation of learning, grade books, teacher coaching, and teacher report cards. Supervisors, school principals, and deputy principals formulate a schedule for academic supervision. The preparation of academic supervision schedules is based on technical guidelines for supervisors.

From the results of confirmation with the Deputy Principal and Teachers at SMKN 1 Al Mubarkeya Aceh Besar, the plan for academic supervision for the Supervisor and Principal of the school was indeed made at the beginning of the school year. The preparation of the program starts from administrative preparation, preparation of the annual program, semester program and schedule of class visits.

The author [8] reveals, "The school principal is a central figure in planning to improve the quality of education in schools". The success or failure of an educational institution, especially in an academic unit, is greatly influenced by the competence of the principal. According to Mulyasa [8], "The school principal is one of the components of education that has the most role in improving the quality of education".

Then the author [9] also stated, "The school principal is a school manager who coordinates with the Supervisor, who is directly responsible for ensuring activities within an organisation are carried out with members of the organisation". Through the development of society and education in our country, Indonesia, from the Dutch colonial era until the time of independence until now, the obligations and responsibilities of educational leaders in general and school principals, in particular, have also experienced developments and changes. Meanwhile, the author [10] argues, "These changes can be divided into three aspects: Changes in objectives, Changes in responsibilities/obligations, and Changes in their nature."

These three aspects are very closely related and difficult to separate. The author [11] explains, "There are changes in educational goals, also changing the scope or breadth of responsibilities that educational leaders must bear and carry out". This also changes the leadership traits that must be carried out to achieve the goals that have been set. The author [12] argues, "Supervision programs usually contain activities that will be carried out to improve teacher performance in improving the learning situation for which they are responsible."

The supervision program contains various efforts and actions that need to be carried out so that learning becomes better and the learning acceleration of students is faster in developing their potential because the teacher is more capable of teaching. Supervisor work plans related to managerial supervision are required to refer to aspects of the function and substance of school management. Factors of management functions include planning, organising, coordinating, controlling, monitoring and evaluating, and reporting. At the same time, aspects of school managerial substance include management of curriculum and learning, management of workforce, oversight of students, control of school finances and financing, management of school facilities and infrastructure and management of school relations with the community.

Supervisors must have qualified knowledge in viewing school management as a unified system in which functional aspects and managerial substance are combined. The effectiveness of implementing management substance in schools depends on the ability of the principal to implement management functions from planning to reporting, as shown in the figure on the following page. The supervisor's task of assisting the school principal in developing the vision and mission of the target school until it is included in the school work plan is urgently needed.

Various knowledge and skills are required in preparing an effective supervision plan. Which factor is more needed depends on the situation, the conditions in which the program is drawn up, and the goals to be achieved. Each supervisor must be aware of their position, whether as a principal, overseer/supervisor, or holder of administrative authority. He must determine which factors are more necessary to develop a plan that

suits the situation and the goals he wants to achieve.

The conclusion from the planning process for academic supervision carried out by the Head of SMKN 1, Al Mubarkeya Aceh Besar, is that it starts with preparing an academic supervision schedule based on referrals from the department. So that the implementation content is by official standards. At the same time, the plan for supervising class visits can be determined twice every semester from the beginning of the semester and the end of the semester.

The expected results from the preparation of the principal's academic supervision program are that the implementation of the supervision can run smoothly by what has been determined to improve Teacher performance in preparing learning tools, carrying out learning, evaluating learning outcomes, and getting solutions to problems experienced during the learning process. Improving the quality of the learning process will produce satisfactory grades for students, and with extracurricular activities can have various skills. Besides that, quality can also be seen from the values of life that are assessed, such as morality, encouragement to move forward, and so on.

The strategy for implementing academic supervision for school supervisors and principals to improve the quality of learning at SMKN 1 Al Mubarkeya Aceh Besar is carried out directly through in-class inspections and outside-class interviews. The author [4] explains, "Implementation of supervision that is right on target certainly requires a strategy from a supervisor". Likewise, the author [10] states, "Academic supervision is related to activities in creating conducive situations in the implementation of learning, so supervisors can use various supervision techniques which include individual and group techniques".

During the implementation of academic supervision, the principal coordinates with the supervisor to carry out maintenance. The author [13] explains, "In the implementation of academic supervision as well, the principal has emphasised the importance of mastering the teacher's work/tasks". Therefore, the principal pays attention so that the teacher tries to improve performance in carrying out his duties so that the goal of improving the quality of learning at SMK Negeri 1 Al Mubarkeya can be adequately achieved.

Supervision implementation strategies, namely class visits and interviews outside the classroom, the principal begins by supervising learning tools. The focus is on the teacher's ability to prepare learning programs such as syllabus, lesson plans, annual programs, semester programs, determining KKM, and other administration related to learning activities. This explanation concludes that in implementing academic supervision, the Supervisor and Head of SMK Negeri 1 Al Mubarkeya emphasise the importance of mastery of the teacher's work/tasks. Therefore, school principals and supervisors pay attention so that teachers try to improve performance in carrying out their duties so that the goals of improving the quality of learning can be adequately achieved.

In general, it was also found that the coordination of the school principal and supervisors in implementing academic supervision at SMKN 1 Al Mubarkeya was very intensive. This can be seen from the state of the performance of educational management; the intensity of coordination between school principals and school supervisors in the implementation of academic supervision, coaching has been carried out according to procedures; and optimal application of appropriate techniques in monitoring, assessing and fostering educational leadership.

Then, the author [8] explained that the coordination evaluation function includes: "Evaluating reporting on control activities, guarantees, and determining the quality of education for various components of education in schools as a form of accountability for the implementation of education". This accountability will be aimed at reporting the progress and results of supervision to the Head of the District/City, Provincial and/or National Education Office, documenting the progress and results of care to their target schools, School Committees and other stakeholders.

Planning academic supervision is one of the tasks of the school supervisor and principal. Therefore, supervisors and school principals must coordinate with each other to have a good working relationship and must be able to design an academic supervision program plan so that they can carry out their duties as well as possible. The concept of academic supervision program planning in designing academic supervision program planning includes preparing implementation and monitoring planning documents for the educational supervision process.

As for the benefits of planning an academic supervision program, namely: providing guidelines for implementation and educational supervision, equating perceptions of all elements of the school regarding the academic supervision program, guaranteeing savings and effectiveness in the use of school resources (personnel, time, and costs). Meanwhile, the planning principles of the academic supervision program are objective (data presented as is), responsible, sustainable, based on national education standards, and based on the needs and conditions of the school/madrasah.

The author [14] explains that the scope of planning for academic supervision consists of: "Implementation of the independent curriculum, preparation, implementation, and assessment of learning by teachers, achievement of graduate competency standards, process standards, content standards, and implementation regulations, as well as improving the quality of learning (through learning activity models based on process standards, learning processes to increase the ability of participants educate them to become quality human resources and have entrepreneurial instincts".

Students can form character and have a good mindset so that they can develop their abilities as human beings who are independent, creative, and have national insights. Active involvement of students in the learning process that is carried out in earnest to understand concepts that are not limited to the material taught by the teacher is responsible for the quality of planning learning activities in each subject.

As is well known, the task of being a supervisor in education at the primary and secondary education unit level is assigned to the school supervisor and principal. Supervision is carried out by supervisors for teachers, both for lesson planning, implementation, and learning assessment. All of this is aimed at improving the quality of learning.

Based on the results of research conducted at SMK Negeri 1 Al Mubarkeya Aceh Besar that there were various obstacles encountered in the implementation of academic supervision, namely the lack of supervision time carried out by the supervisor, the limited time for the principal to supervise teachers, the lack of senior teachers/colleagues to assist the principal in implementation of academic supervision, lack of experience of supervisors, lack of personal, leadership and professional qualities, incentives from the government that are still lacking and, motivation is still lacking.

The obstacles above can be explained as follows: first, the distribution of supervisors is uneven, and the supervisor's time is limited. School supervisors are "super" people with a minimal number. Therefore, in some areas, the school supervisor has an extensive range of work. The large proportion of work and the distribution of visiting time carried out by Supervisors can also be a problem in supervision tasks.

Second, Supervisory competence is uneven. It is common knowledge that the problem of human resources in education is a classic problem that has not been resolved to date. This also applies to supervisors. There may be supervisors who have competence but do not comprehensively understand their duties as supervisors or supervisors who supervise fields of study that are not suitable. This can occur due to the limited number of human resources.

Third, the complexity of the managerial tasks of a school principal. The author [15] stated, "One of the duties of the school principal is the task of supervising the teacher. This task can be attached to a school principal." However, the complexity of the principal's managerial tasks can make his supervisory duties not optimal, as in supervising the learning carried out by his teachers. Thus, this is also one of the problems in implementing educational supervision.

Fourth, quality culture has not materialised. Creating a quality culture in every educational institution is the dream of every academic person. For example, the teacher who will be supervised still thinks that educational supervision is solely an activity to find fault. Even though educational supervision is implemented with prior notification to the teacher who will be managed, the teachers who will be supervised have not optimally prepared themselves. So this is also one of the problems in implementing educational supervision.

Fifth, the following educational supervision problem is that supervisor subjectivity is still felt. The element of subjectivity from the supervisor is challenging to get rid of. The point is that there is an impression that the form of supervision carried out can be influenced by the teacher being supervised. For example, there will be different treatment for teachers who are considered sen-

ior. Thus, this is also one of the problems in implementing educational supervision.

Sixth, often, there is a change of principal. It is common knowledge that the political climate can influence the Principal's Office in the region. This can lead to frequent changes in the principal of the school. This certainly impacts the school environment, including implementing educational supervision, especially on the sustainability of activities or recommendations/improvements.

Seventh, Limited and uneven facilities and infrastructure. A teacher must feel uncomfortable conveying subject matter in every teaching and learning process related to facilities and infrastructure problems. Therefore, minimal facilities and infrastructure can interfere with the teacher's preparation in carrying out learning and suggestions from supervisors. So this is also one of the problems in implementing educational supervision.

Finally, *eighth*, as stated by [15] that: "The last problem with educational supervision is that the follow-up plan (RTL) is not optimal". Another main problem of education in Indonesia is consistency in what is good. It could be that the supervised teacher has made improvements based on the supervisor's suggestions, but that could only happen during supervision. After supervision is over, the teacher may remain in the 'comfort zone' again. Thus, this is also one of the problems in implementing educational management.

CONCLUSIONS

Based on the results of the research and discussion, it is concluded that:

The planning of the school supervisor and principal's academic supervision program for improving the quality of learning at SMK Negeri 1 Al-Mubarkeya Aceh Besar District was carried out at the beginning of the school year. The planning stages for academic supervision Supervisors and school principals start by preparing the educational supervision semester program; through meetings with the teacher council, the school principal conveys the program directly. As for the supervision program, namely: supervision of learning devices, monitoring lesson plans, learning processes and assessment of learning outcomes.

The strategy for implementing academic supervision for school supervisors and principals for the process of improving the quality of learning at SMK Negeri 1 Al-Mubarkeya Aceh Besar District is with an initial survey before carrying out academic supervision, class visits, outside-class interviews, and evaluation (review) of the results of class visits.

Obstacles to coordinating academic supervision of school supervisors and principals towards the process of improving the quality of learning at SMK Negeri 1 Al-Mubarkeya Aceh Besar District, namely, namely the lack of supervision time carried out by the supervisor, the limited time for the principal to supervise teachers, the lack of senior/peer teachers to assist the principal in carrying out academic supervision, the lack of experience of supervisors, the lack of personal, leadership and professional qualities, incentives from the government that still lacking and, motivation is still lacking.

REFERENCES

1. Barnawi., Arifin, M. (2018). *Kinerja Guru Profesional: Instrumen Pembinaan, Peningkatan & Penilaian* [Professional Teacher Performance: An Instrument for Coaching, Improvement & Assessment]. Yogyakarta: Ar-Ruzz Media (in Indonesian).

2. Setiyo, H., & Purwanto, S. (2019). *Supervisi dan Penilaian Kinerja Guru* [Supervision and Teacher Performance Appraisal]. Jakarta: Direktorat Jenderal Guru dan Tenaga Pendidikan (in Indonesian).

3. Creswell, J. W. (2017). *Research Design*. Retrieved from https://www.ucg.ac.me/skladiste/blog_609332/objava_105202/fajlovi/Creswell.pdf

4. Arikunto, S. (2019). *Dasar-Dasar Supervisi* [Basics of Supervision]. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta (in Indonesian).

5. Indrawan, R. (2018). *Metodologi Penelitian kuantitaf, kualitatif dan campuran* [Quantitative, qualitative and mixed research methodologies]. Bandung: Refika Aditama (in Indonesian).

6. Nisa', N. Z., Sunandar, S., & Miyono, N. (2021). Pengaruh Supervisi Akademik Dan Iklim Organisasi Sekolah Terhadap Motivasi Kerja Guru Sekolah Menengah Pertama Di Kecamatan Kedung Kabupaten Jepara [The Influence of Academic Supervision and School Organisational Climate on Work Motivation of Junior High School Teachers in Kedung District, Jepara Regency]. *Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan (JMP), 9*(2). doi: 10.26877/jmp.v9i2.8114 (in Indonesian).

7. Purwanto. (2018). *Evaluasi Hasil Belajar* [Evaluation of Learning Outcomes]. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar (in Indonesian).

8. Machali, I. ., & Munawaroh, F. A. . (2020). Manajemen Pengembangan Sumber Daya Pendidik di Taman Pendidikan Al-Qur'an (TPQ) Al-Hidayah Purwogondo Kalinyamatan Jepara [Management of Educator Resource Development at Al-Hidayah Purwogondo Qur'anic Education Centre (TPQ) Kalinyamatan Jepara]. *AN NUR: Jurnal Studi Islam*, 6(2) (in Indonesian).

9. Kuswana, S. W. (2018). *Kontribusi Organisasi Pembelajaran, Peran serta KKG, Komite Sekolah, Pengawas Mata Pelajaran, Terhadap Kinerja Guru SMKN di Propinsi Jawa Barat* [Contribution of Learning Organisation, Participation of KKG, School Committee, and Subject Supervisor to the Performance of SMKN Teachers in West Java Province]. Retrieved from http://file.upi.edu/Direktori/FPTK/JUR._PEND._TEKNIK_MESIN/195703041993021-WOWO_SUNARYO_KUSWANA/MAKALAH-RISET/Konstribusi_Organisasi_Pembelajaran.pdf (in Indonesian).

10. Susanto, A. (2019). *Manajemen Peningkatan Kinerja Guru Konsep, Strategi dan Implementasinya* [Teacher Performance Improvement Management Concepts, Strategies and Implementation]. Jakarta: Kencana (in Indonesian).

11. Lase, D. (2019). Pendidikan di Era Revolusi Industri 4.0 [Education in the Age of Industrial Revolution 4.0]. *Jurnal Sundermann,* 1(1), 16-24 (in Indonesian).

12. Supardi, D. (2018). *Kinerja Guru* [Teacher Performance]. Jakarta: Rajawali Pers (in Indonesian).

13. Lantip, D. (2018). *Manajemen Strategi* [Strategy Management]. Yogyakarta : UNY Press (in Indonesian).

14. Sanglah, I. N. (2021). Peningkatan Kinerja Guru Melalui Supervisi Kepala Sekolah pada Sekolah Dasar. *Jurnal Pedagogi Dan Pembelajaran, 4*(3), 528. doi: 10.23887/jp2.v4i3.40700 (in Indonesian).

15. Kunandar. (2018). *Pelaksanaan Pembelajaran* [Learning Implementation]. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya (in Indonesian).